

Unconfirmed minutes

The University of Manchester

SENATE

Wednesday, 4 November 2009

Present:

Professor Rothwell (in the Chair)

Professor Aarons, Dr Allan, Professors Bailey, Börjars, Coombs, Drs Cobb, Davies, Professors Devine, Eccles, Dr Edwards, Professors Esmail, Fagan, Humphries, Gale, Dr Brockhaus-Grand, Professor Helliwell, Mr Jones, Professor Kirschen, Drs McBride, McCrohan, McGovern, Miss Medforth, Professor North, Drs Lane-Serff, Malik, Professors Masters, O'Brien, Rezzazadeh, Drs Sharma, Schiessl, Professor Stirling, Dr Timmerman, Drs Valderas Martinez, Vallely, Professor Vincent and Ms Wilkinson (37).

For unreserved business: Mr Hassan, Mr Jenkinson and Ms Kate Little (Students' Union).

By invitation: Professor Beattie (School of Psychological Sciences), Professor Castree (School of Environment and Development), Professor Gibson (School of Electrical and Electronic Engineering), Professor Luker (School of Nursing and Social Work), Professor Sutcliffe (School of Chemical Engineering and Analytical Sciences), Professor Whitehead (School of Chemistry)

In attendance: The Registrar and Secretary and the Head of the Student Services Centre.

1. Minutes

Confirmed: the minutes of the meetings held on 24 June 2009 and on 22 July 2009.

2. Matters arising from the minutes

There were no matters arising not dealt with elsewhere on the agenda.

3. Statement by the President and Vice-Chancellor

The Deputy President and Deputy Vice-Chancellor provided an oral supplement to the written statement of the President and Vice-Chancellor as follows:

- (a) Reflecting on the University's achievements since October 2004 she highlighted the work that remained to be done in relation to the much needed transformation of the student learning experience and enrichment of the Manchester student experience. To this end the implementation of the recommendations of the *Review of Undergraduate Education* would be given the highest possible priority in 2009-10 and beyond and that Senate would have a major role in holding the University community to account on this matter.
- (b) *Guiding the University through Uncertainty* remained the key working document informing the approach that the University would be taking to emerging public funding stringency. A significant consideration in the ongoing process of contingency planning would be the proposals in Peter Mandelson's recently published *New Framework for Higher Education*.

- (c) The University's 2008-09 financial result (pre-audit) indicated an operating surplus that meant that the University was better placed than it had expected to be at this stage. In the meantime, work was underway to ensure the submission to HEFCE of the University's 2009 Five-Year Forecast (covering the period 2009-14). While the forecasts for 2009-10 and 2010-11 could be derived with considerable confidence on the basis of announcements by HEFCE following the 22 April 2009 Budget Statement there was too much uncertainty about the external financial environment for the latter years of the period concerned. Therefore, for the periods 2011-14 it had been agreed with HEFCE that the forecast would simply carry forward funding assumptions based on current Government spending plans for 2009-11.
- (d) Preliminary indications were that the University would achieve or exceed its targets for all categories of students once the final registration numbers were known at the 1 December census. The performance overall would include an additional 134 places that the University had accepted as its proportion of the extra 10,000 full-time undergraduate places announced by the Secretary of State for Business, Innovation and Skills in July 2009. Although the Government had declined to provide additional HEFCE income for these numbers the University had based its decision to take them on the fact that they would represent some insurance against the penalty of £10k per student for any over enrolment of home students. Furthermore, accepting 134 of the 260 places that had been offered, even on less generous terms than in the past, was compensation for the places that the University had applied for under an earlier programme of Additional Student Numbers (ASNs) but which had been abandoned as part of the HEFCE's initial stringency measures. In the meantime, staff were to be congratulated for achieving the numbers they had, including a contingency for those that it was anticipated would drop out before 1 December. For the future it was noted that there would need to be some consideration of the balance of home and international students in the overall student body.
- (e) Following a review of the University's collaboration with Manchester Metropolitan University in the delivery of Architecture programmes the recommendation to sign a new five year agreement had been approved at the October meeting of the Board of Governors on the understanding that during the period of the Agreement engagement in architectural education would be at worst cost neutral to the University and that rigorous performance indicators would be developed to monitor progress.
- (f) In the wake of the departures of Professor Perkins and Gaskell to chief executive level posts at other institutions two key changes had been required in the Senior Executive of the University. Professors Matt Lambon Ralph and Chris Taylor had been appointed as Associate vice-Presidents for Research to assist Professor Dame Nancy Rothwell who had assumed overall strategic leadership for the research and graduate education agenda within the University. At the same time the University was undertaking an international search for a replacement for Professor Perkins. The appointment process was expected to be completed by the end of November. In a further change Mr Christopher Petty had been appointed as the University's General Counsel from 1 September 2009. In response to a query regarding the arrangements to replace Professor Alistair Ulph, Vice-President and Dean of the Faculty of Humanities, following the announcement of his intention to retire from the University in September 2010 it was confirmed that the expectation was that there was sufficient time to appoint a replacement without the need for any interim arrangements.
- (g) Given that the University had identified the Jiao Tong University Index as a primary indicator of its international standing and competitiveness its position at 41st in the recently announced rankings for 2009 was disappointing.

4. Vice-President (Teaching and Learning)

(a) Report on Teaching and Learning

Received: a paper prepared by the Vice-President (Teaching and Learning)

Noted:

- (i) That while there were examples of excellent educational practice across the University the results of the 2009 National Student Survey (NSS), which placed the University at 132nd out of 183 institutions in the UK, indicated that these were more the exception than the rule. Not only was this inconsistent with the University's world class aspirations but was also a grave reputational risk, both nationally and internationally.
- (ii) That to address the institutional underperformance in the NSS it had been agreed that teaching and learning would be the major focus of the 2009 Operational and Performance Reviews (OPRs).
- (iii) That the previous 18 months had seen significant progress made in the implementation of the recommendations of the *Review of Undergraduate Education* initiated by the President and Vice-Chancellor in 2007. While it was acknowledged that it would take time before the impact of some of the steps taken would be evident it was the case that there were several key recommendations from the Review that needed to be progressed more quickly than was currently the case i.e., those relating to personalised learning, innovative teaching and a range of improvements to the student experience. It was notable that some areas were pursuing these matters more aggressively than others albeit that the evidence was that all Schools were engaging with their students to identify changes that would improve the quality of their experience.
- (iv) That while currently three out of four students reported that they were satisfied with their learning experience it would be necessary to increase this to nine out of ten for the University's ranking on the basis of its NSS results to be among the top five institutions. While it was believed that the actions being taken in Schools would yield an improvement it should be noted that they were being introduced on a phased basis starting with Year 1 so it would take time for them to be embedded fully.
- (v) That in order to understand better from the perspective of Heads of School the particular issues they felt impacted negatively on students' experience the Vice-President (Teaching and Learning), together with the Head of the Teaching and Learning Support Office (TLSO), had initiated a series of meetings. To date the three issues that had been raised repeatedly were: *Campus Solutions*, central timetabling and the condition of the teaching estate.
- (vi) That with respect to central timetabling a recent meeting with colleagues from the Central Timetabling Unit (CTU) had revealed that a large proportion of the University's teaching accommodation was below its own internally defined minimum standard. It was recognised, therefore, that there were some serious matters to be addressed but equally there would be major resource implications to consider. Therefore, as a first step, the Vice-President (Teaching and Learning) would chair a small group to review the CTU procedures and processes. However, for this to be a productive endeavour it would be crucial for colleagues from Schools to engage actively in the work of the Review.

- (vii) That as far as *Campus Solutions* was concerned the Registrar and Secretary had initiated a review of the performance difficulties that had been experienced recently. Additional consultancy expertise has been secured on a short term basis to assist with this task.
- (viii) That a recent problem whereby approximately 10% of staff, followed by a similar proportion of students, had lost their access to *Blackboard* had been resolved relatively quickly albeit that the problem had not been with the system itself but rather with the University's IT registration system. However, the incident had demonstrated the need for greater priority to be placed on timely communication in similar situations. Colleagues needed to be informed of problems and that they were being worked on at the earliest opportunity even if the cause of the problem and its resolution had still to be established.
- (ix) That the work of an Assessment and Feedback Working Group, established by the Teaching and Learning Group, was underway. In recognition of the fact that there would be no single solution and that colleagues in Schools were approaching the issues of feedback in different ways the aim would be to conduct a review of that practice which would then inform the development of a policy to provide students with feedback on their assessed work within a fixed number of days. In parallel the Group would determine a common, comparable marking scheme to enable greater take up of cross- and inter-disciplinary units and develop a plan for implementation.

During the ensuing discussion the following points were made.

- (i) In response to a concern about the extent to which the various difficulties outlined by the Vice-President (Teaching and Learning) had combined to undermine general confidence in the integrity of the University's IT systems there were no substantial grounds for not trusting IT systems. Furthermore, the difficulties that had been experienced were unrelated. The major outage that had occurred recently had been resolved quickly, the cause identified and, when the systems were restored, all the data was there. The particular issues relating to *Campus Solutions* were known and the University was in dialogue with *Oracle* as part of the steps being taken to address them.
- (ii) The devolution of responsibility for new academics' training to individual Faculties created the potential locally to establish links between the processes of peer review and the arrangements for personal development reviews (PDRs). In the meantime, some work had been done to deliver training on specific teaching-related activities e.g., *Blackboard*. However, it was acknowledged that there was limited provision of courses for teaching and that this would need to be reviewed and the provision on an enhanced portfolio considered. In the meantime, it was stressed that teaching was valued although it was recognised that this was not always the perception among staff. All University promotions committees considered cases made on the basis of teaching.
- (iii) To make a significant impact on the quality of the University's teaching space would require an allocation of substantial capital resources for a programme of refurbishment. To date new building, including accommodation for Schools and the new Learning Commons, had already been prioritised. In the absence of new additional funds it would be possible only to approach things on a piecemeal basis. However, it would be the University's Capital Monitoring Group that would be responsible for these decisions.

- (iv) In response to a concern about the extent to which high numbers of students in classes impacted negatively on the student experience it was acknowledged that it was necessary for Faculties and Schools, when determining their student number targets, to balance the need to improve income levels with the physical considerations that might constrain the numbers of students they could recruit.
 - (v) Specific details regarding the provision of support to a student with a disability were raised, and if the information was sent directly to the Registrar and Secretary he agreed to take up the matter directly with relevant colleagues in the Disability Support Office (DSO).
 - (vi) According to data from the National Union of Students (NUS) 57% of students expected to receive feedback within 1-2 weeks of submission of the piece of work concerned. However, there was felt to be little evidence that this was currently the case in the University.
 - (vii) Investigation by colleagues in the School of Physics into their relatively poor performance in Assessment and Feedback in the 2009 NSS had suggested that in part this was because *Campus Solutions* did not calculate an overall average mark according to the rules for the programme concerned. Acknowledging that in system terms it would be possible to do this calculation it was noted that current practice whereby the mark was calculated differently for different programmes not only made this difficult but was not a position that could be sustained in the longer term. Consequently, it was a matter a working group to review the University undergraduate degree regulations would consider.
 - (viii) Mention of a *comparable marking scheme* in the report on the work of the Assessment and Feedback Working Group was a reference to the need to achieve greater clarity and consistency around several matters, including the justification for the allocation of marks and the use of the full mark range.
- (b) Dates of graduation ceremonies in July

Received: a proposal that for 2010, and thereafter, the July graduation ceremonies be scheduled to commence 4 weeks after the end of Semester 2.

Noted:

That concerns had been expressed by colleagues in Schools about the relatively short period between the end of the examination period and the start of the graduation ceremonies. There was a need to ensure that assessment results were processed accurately and to provide the detailed information required for final year students in order that their degree certificates be produced and the ceremony programme printed. Furthermore, it was anticipated that planned developments, including the implementation of *Digitary* to facilitate the production of a Bologna compliant transcript for every student upon their graduation and the subsequent introduction of the Higher Education Achievement Record (HEAR) would require more preparation of data within demanding timescales. Therefore, it was proposed that arrangements be introduced whereby there would be a fixed period of 4 weeks between the end of the second semester undergraduate examinations period and the start of the graduation ceremonies in July. This proposal had been endorsed by both the Teaching and Learning Group (TLG) and the Graduate Education Group (GEG).

Agreed:

To approve the proposal that for 2010-11, and thereafter, the July graduation ceremonies be scheduled to commence 4 weeks after the end of Semester 2. Consequently, the dates of the ceremonies in each of the next four years would be:

2009-10	5-16 July 2010
2010-11	11-22 July 2011
2011-12	9-20 July 2012
2012-13	8-19 July 2013.

5. Deputy President and Deputy Vice-Chancellor**Reported:**

- (a) That the new Associate Vice-Presidents (Research), Professor Matt Lambon Ralph and Professor Chris Taylor had been appointed. Their respective portfolios of duties had been agreed. They would both work closely with the Faculty Associate Deans for Research and for Graduate Education.
- (b) That the Associate Vice-President (Graduate Education) was leading on the University's response to the current HEFCE consultation on the Research Excellence Framework (REF) 2009. The deadline for submission was 16 December 2009.
- (c) That the recent Operational and Performance Reviews (OPRs) had indicated that in a number of areas the targets for research income had not been met and that in several instances funding rates were falling. It was also the case that PhD completion rates had either not improved or were doing so only slowly.
- (d) That the University's Research Profiling Exercise 2009 was underway. Unlike research profiling activities previously conducted at School and Faculty level the current exercise would be undertaken on a common University-wide basis and the individual research outputs to be considered would be drawn from the Manchester eScholar. The Assessment Panels would meet during November and December so that feedback on the Exercise might be provided early in 2010. Furthermore, it was intended that this would be an annual exercise albeit that the exact methodology to be used in future would, in part, be determined on the basis of the experience of the current one. There was an institutional imperative for an accurate, up-to-date research profile to help inform future planning decisions.

During the ensuing discussion concerns were expressed that not only would the exercise involve the assessment of individuals, unlike the Research Assessment Exercise (RAE) which had been a grading of research outputs rather than of individual staff, but also that it had been initiated internally and not in response to an external driver e.g., RAE. In response to concerns about the potential for the infringement of copyright the Associate Vice-President (Graduate Education) undertook to refer the matter to the Manchester eScholar Group.

(Action: Associate Vice-President (Graduate Education))

6. Consensual relationships policy

Received: a policy on consensual relationships that had been drafted by the Director of Human Resources.

Noted:

That the policy had been developed in consultation with the Head of Student Support and Services and with the campus Trade Unions in response to a direct recommendation from a case heard by the Office of the Independent Adjudicator (OIA). Its purpose was to ensure that the correct procedures were in place so that members of staff were not open to allegations of impropriety, bias, abuse of authority, discrimination, conflict of interest or favouritism. Following discussion and subject to a small amendment* to the final bullet point in Section 4.1 it was

Agreed

That the Consensual Relationships Policy be approved for introduction with immediate effect.

**Secretary's note: following the meeting of Senate the policy was amended so that the penultimate sentence in the final bullet point in Section 4.1 now states: This is applicable even if the relationship is consensual and the person does not teach the young person but works in the same institution where the young person is studying.*

7. Dates for semesters

Received: the dates for semesters in 2013-2014.

8. Matters for report to Senate

- (a) Report on exercise of delegations (on behalf of Senate and the Board of Governors)

Professorial appointments

The following appointments had been approved on behalf of Senate and the Board of Governors:

***Ad Personam* Promotional Chair in Atmospheric Multiphase Processes**

Gordan McFiggans, BEng, MSc, PhD (East Anglia), previously Senior Lecturer in the School of Earth, Atmospheric and Environmental Sciences, as Professor of Atmospheric Multiphase Processes in the School of Earth, Atmospheric and Environmental Sciences from 1 January 2009.

***Ad Personam* Promotional Chair in Applied Econometrics**

Martyn Andrews, BA, MSc, PhD (London School of Economics), previously Senior Lecturer at this University as Professor of Applied Econometrics in the School of Social Sciences from 1 August 2009.

***Ad Personam* Promotional Chair in Poverty and Social Justice**

Armando Barrientos, BA, PhD (University of Kent at Canterbury), previously Senior Research Fellow at this University as Professor of Poverty and Social Justice in the School of Environment and Development from 1 August 2009.

***Ad Personam* Promotional Chair in Marketing and Strategy**

Stephen Henneberg, BA, MA, PhD (Cambridge), previously Senior Lecturer at this University as Professor of Marketing and Strategy in the Manchester Business School from 1 August 2009.

Ad Personam Promotional Chair in International Development

Uma Kothari, BA, MA, PhD (Edinburgh), previously Reader in International Development at this University, as Professor of International Development in the School of Environment and Development from 1 August 2009.

Ad Personam Promotional Chair in Linguistics

John Payne, BA, MA (Cambridge), previously Senior Lecturer in Linguistics at this University, as Professor of Linguistics in the School of Languages, Linguistics and Cultures from 1 August 2009.

Ad Personam Promotional Chair in International Business

Rudolf Sinkovics, MBA, PhD (Vienna), previously Reader at this University, as Professor of International Business in the Manchester Business School from 1 August 2009.

Ad Personam Promotional Chair in Environmental Geochemistry

David Polya, BSc, PhD (Manchester), previously Reader in the School of Earth, Atmospheric and Environmental Sciences, as Professor of Environmental Geochemistry in the School of Earth, Atmospheric and Environmental Sciences from 1 August 2009.

Ad Personam Promotional Chair in Electrical Materials

Simon Rowland, BSc, PhD (UOL), previously Senior Lecturer in the School of Electrical and Electronic Engineering, as Professor of Electrical Materials in the School of Electrical and Electronic Engineering from 1 August 2009.

Ad Personam Promotional Chair in Computer Science

Sophia Ananiadou, DEA, PhD (UMIST), previously Reader in the School of Computer Science, as Professor of Computer Science in the School of Computer Science from 1 August 2009.

Ad Personam Promotional Chair in Condensed Matter Physics

Andrei Golov, MSc, PhD (Institute of Solid State Physics), previously Reader in the School of Physics and Astronomy, as Professor of Condensed Matter Physics in the School of Physics and Astronomy from 1 August 2009.

Ad Personam Promotional Chair in High Voltage Engineering

Zhongdong Wang, BSc, MSc, PhD (UMIST), previously Senior Lecturer in the School of Electrical and Electronic Engineering, as Professor of High Voltage Engineering in the School of Electrical and Electronic Engineering from 1 August 2009.

Ad Personam Promotional Chair in Biological Physics

Henggui Zhang, BSc, MSc, PhD (Leeds), previously Reader in the School of Physics and Astronomy, as Professor of Biological Physics in the School of Physics and Astronomy from 1 August 2009.

Ad Personam Promotional Chair in Astrophysics

Richard Davis, BA, PhD (Manchester), previously Reader in the School of Physics and Astronomy, as Professor of Astrophysics in the School of Physics and Astronomy from 1 August 2009.

Ad Personam Promotional Chair in Astrophysics

Philippa Browning, BA, PhD (St Andrews), previously Reader in the School of Physics and Astronomy, as Professor of Astrophysics in the School of Physics and Astronomy from 1 August 2009.

Ad Personam Promotional Chair in Mathematics

Peter Eccles, BA, PhD (Manchester), previously Senior Lecturer in the School of Mathematics, as Professor of Mathematics in the School of Mathematics from 1 August 2009.

Ad Personam Promotional Chair in Surface Atmosphere Exchange and Micrometeorological Research

Martin Gallagher, BSc, PhD (UMIST), previously Reader in the School of Earth, Atmospheric and Environmental Sciences, as Professor of Surface Atmosphere Exchange and Micrometeorological Research in the School of Earth, Atmospheric and Environmental Sciences from 1 August 2009.

Ad Personam Promotional Chair in Structural and Fire Engineering

Yong Wang, BEng, PhD (Sheffield), previously Reader in the School of Mechanical, Aerospace and Civil Engineering, as Professor of Structural and Fire Engineering in the School of Mechanical, Aerospace and Civil Engineering from 1 August 2009.

Ad Personam Promotional Chair in Pharmaceutical Sciences

Brian Lockwood, BPharm, PhD, FHEA, previously Senior Lecturer at this University as Professor of Pharmaceutical Sciences in the School of Pharmacy and Pharmaceutical Sciences from 1 August 2009.

Ad Personam Promotional Chair in General Practice

Carolyn Chew-Graham, BSc, MD, MBChB, FRCGP, previously Senior Clinical Lecturer in Primary Care at this University, as Professor of General Practice in the School of Medicine from 1 August 2009.

Ad Personam Promotional Chair in Nursing

Ann-Louise Caress, BNurse RGN, PhD (Liverpool), previously Senior Lecturer in Nursing at this University, as Professor of Nursing in the School of Nursing, Midwifery and Social Work from 1 August 2009.

Ad Personam Promotional Chair in Rheumatology

Ian Bruce, MRCP, MD, FRCP, previously Reader of Rheumatology at this University, as Professor of Rheumatology in the School of Medicine from 1 August 2009.

Ad Personam Promotional Chair in Dental Education

Nicholas Grey, BDS, MSc, MRD RCS Ed, previously Senior Clinical teaching Fellow at the University, as Professor of Dental Education in the School of Dentistry from 1 August 2009.

Ad Personam Promotional Chair in Economics

Horst Zank, MSc, PhD (Maastricht), previously Reader in Economics at this University, as Professor of Economics in the School of Social Sciences from 1 January 2009.

Chair of Commercial Law

Geraint Howells, LLB, BVC (Inner Temple), previously Professor at the University of Lancaster, as Professor of Commercial Law in the School of Law from 1 September 2008.

Chair of Organisation Studies

Michael Bresnen, BA, PhD (Nottingham), previously Professor of Organisational Behaviour at the University of Leicester, as Professor of Organisation Studies from 1 January 2009.

Director of the Photon Science Institute

Professor Richard Winpenny as Director of the Photon Science Institute, for the period 1 October 2009 to 30 September 2012.

Grant of the title of Reader

The University Promotions Committee for the Faculties listed below, on behalf of the Senate and the Board of Governors, had approved recommendations that the following, who currently held appointment as Senior Lecturer or Senior Research Fellow in the Schools indicated, be granted the title of Reader with effect from 1 August 2009:

Faculty of Engineering and Physical Sciences

Ursel Bangert	Materials
Anne Juel	Mathematics
Xiaogang Chen	Materials
Ian Cotton	Electrical and Electronic Engineering
Francoise Tisseur	Mathematics
Mohammed Sheikh	Mechanical, Aerospace and Civil Engineering
Brian Saunders	Materials
Renate Schmidt	Computer Science
Jon Shapiro	Computer Science
Stephen Eichhorn	Materials
Thorsten Wengler	Physics and Astronomy

Promotions to Senior Lecturer

The University Promotions Committee for the Faculties listed below, on behalf of the Senate and the Board of Governors, had approved recommendations that the following, who currently held appointment as Lecturer or Research Fellow in the Schools indicated, be granted the title of Senior Lecturer with effect from 1 August 2009:

Faculty of Engineering and Physical Sciences

Charles Eaton	Mathematics
Steve Pettifer	Computer Science
Andrew Hazel	Mathematics
Alexander Lanzon	Electrical and Electronic Engineering
Jelena Grbic	Mathematics
Nigel Schofield	Electrical and Electronic Engineering
Pammi Sinha	Materials
Margaret Emsley	Mechanical, Aerospace and Civil Engineering
Roelof Van Silfhout	Electrical and Electronic Engineering
Paul Mativenga	Mechanical, Aerospace and Civil Engineering,
Arthur Wilkinson	Materials
Goran Nenadic	Computer Science
David Hodgetts	Earth, Atmospheric and Environmental Science

Grant of the title of Professor Emeritus

Acting on behalf of Senate and the Board of Governors, the President and Vice-Chancellor had approved the conferment of the title of Professor Emeritus/a on the following:

Professor Suzanne Butters, Professor of Art History (in the Faculty of Humanities) (*from 1 October 2009*)

Professor David Garrod, Professor of Development Biology (in the Faculty of Life Sciences) (*from 1 October 2009*)

Professor Roger Hubbard, Professor of Virtual Environments (in the Faculty of Engineering and Physical Sciences) (*from 1 February 2010*)

Professor Bernard Jackson, Professor of Modern Jewish Studies in the School of Arts, Histories and Cultures (*from 1 August 2009*)

Professor Hillel Steiner, Professor of Political Philosophy in the School of Social Sciences (*from 1 October 2009*)

Professor Gordon Tiddy, Professor of Formulation Engineering (in the Faculty of Engineering and Physical Sciences) (*from 1 October 2009*)

- (b) Election of member of Senate to serve on the Planning and Resources Committee

Professor Peter Eccles had been elected to serve as a member of the Planning and Resources Committee from 1 September 2009 until 31 August 2012.

9. Any other business

There was no other business.