

Unconfirmed minutes

The University of Manchester

SENATE

Wednesday, 29 October 2008

Present:

Professor Gilbert (in the Chair)

Professor Addison, Drs Allan, Birse, Brockhaus-Grand, Professor Brown, Dr Browning, Professors Case, Coombs, Drs Cobb, Cotton, Davies, Derrick, Eccles, Professors Esmail, Fagan, Gaskell, Georgiou, Green, Drs Grey, Kimber, Lane-Serff, Lyte, McBride, McGovern, Miss Medforth, Professors O'Brien, Reece, Rubery, Stirling, Drs Qualtrough, Schiessl, Timmermann, Professors, Ulph, Vincent, and Wang (36).

For unreserved business: Mr Gillett, Mr Holloway, Mr Jenkinson, Ms Killip and Mr Lee, Students' Union.

Invited: Professor Agnew (School of Environment and Development) Professor Duck (School of Mathematics), Professor Luker (School of Nursing, Midwifery and Social Work) and Professor Tolz (School of Languages, Linguistics and Cultures).

In attendance: The Head of the Student Services Centre

At the start of the meeting, the President and Vice-Chancellor welcomed those members for whom this was their first meeting and those members who had been re-elected.

1. Minutes

Confirmed: the minutes of the meetings held on 25 June 2008 and on 22 July 2008.

2. Matters arising from the minutes

There were no matters arising not dealt with elsewhere on the agenda.

3. Statement by the President and Vice-Chancellor

The President and Vice-Chancellor provided an oral supplement to his written statement as follows:

- (a) He noted that the final statement of accounts for 2007-08 would shortly be considered by the Finance Committee for approval and submission to HEFCE. Following a year of stringent operation, the University was now operating in balance and had achieved a small operating surplus at the end of July 2008. A similar surplus had also been budgeted for 2008-09. He observed that the Research Assessment Exercise (RAE) and the current external financial environment meant that on reflection the creation of the single University had been particularly well timed. The University had developed financial practices which would stand it in good stead for the future, particularly at a time of instability in the global financial climate. He explained his view that a lifting of the cap on tuition fees was unlikely in the current environment and that the Government might seek to take advantage of the demographic downturn in the number of 18 year olds to

reduce the level of public funding for undergraduate education. There might also be a case for a widespread review of public funded research. Furthermore, it should be anticipated that Trusts and charitable organisations will have reduced funds available to support education and research in the short to medium term. Notwithstanding this he was confident that the University community had the capacity to respond to a challenging environment with creativity, flexibility and innovation. Colleagues should not feel disempowered but have confidence in themselves and the University to be able to manage the resources at its disposal to best effect.

- (b) During the ensuing discussion the Head of the Planning Support Office reported that HEFCE had confirmed recently that there would be no further allocations of Additional Student Numbers (ASNs) for 2009-10 and 2010-11 beyond those already approved or under consideration. The Secretary of State had also requested that HEFCE develop contingency measures that could be used to reduce the risk of institutions over-recruiting, where, given current resources, such over-recruitment could threaten either the sustainability of student financial support or the maintenance of the unit of funding.
- (c) In response to a question regarding the use of reserve accounts, the President clarified that funds earned by an individual for consultancy could be used by that individual for research purposes provided this was in accordance with the University's Financial Regulations. He also noted that the University now had full and transparent information on its costs and stressed the importance of the full costing of activities and budget forecasting.
- (d) He confirmed that a report of student numbers for 2008-09 would be submitted to Senate at its meeting in February 2009 but that initial indications were that substantial enrolment growth was continuing.
- (e) He noted that the Manchester Academic Health Science Centre continued to be a major development for the University.
- (f) He reported that the University's position in the 2008 Shanghai Jiao Tong Academic Ranking of World Universities had improved to 40th, up from 48th in 2007 and explained that no other University had improved its position in this ranking as much as the University of Manchester. Although the data was difficult to disaggregate, it was possible to understand in general terms how Manchester compared with other universities.
- (g) In response to a concern expressed that the 'over-recruitment' of students had a negative impact on the ability of Schools to deliver the personalised learning agenda he observed that over the last three years student:staff ratios had improved across the University and, whilst much of the pressures created by additional student numbers had fallen in the Faculty of Humanities, some Schools in other parts of the University were having problems meeting their recruitment targets.

4. Vice-President (Teaching and Learning)

Received: (a) a report from the Vice-President (Teaching and Learning) on the results of the 2008 National Student Survey (NSS) and (b) a report on the progress of the Implementation of the Review of Undergraduate Education.

Noted:

- (a) That the results of the NSS were available to the public *via* the Unistats website and were likely to become an ever more important factor in applicants' decisions about where to

study. The change in demographics meant that competition in student recruitment was likely to intensify.

- (b) That NSS data were also being used in national league tables. The University's institutional averages were very disappointing, particularly in comparison to the rest of the Russell Group, and there was therefore a concern that this could have a potential negative impact on recruitment in the future.
- (c) Notwithstanding the above comments, some subject areas had performed strongly in the NSS and should be congratulated. 19% of subject areas were exceeding the mean of the upper quartile of their discipline nationally but 44% of subject areas had an overall score below the mean. This indicated that some areas needed to improve more markedly than others.
- (d) That the objective for the Review of Undergraduate Education was to improve the Manchester student experience and therefore it was anticipated that the NSS results would improve over time as a consequence.
- (e) That it was proposed that a President's Medal scheme be introduced with effect from Summer 2009 whereby students of the University who had completed the final examinations for an undergraduate degree and who were reported by the appropriate Faculty to be the most distinguished of such students (normally determined by an academic performance in the top 1%) be recognised by the award of a medal.

During the ensuing discussion the following points were made.

- (a) The possibility of including 'value added' factors when considering nominations for Medal recipients, e.g., students who had entered the University under the auspices of its widening participation initiatives. It was clarified that Medals would be awarded to those students who had performed exceptionally well academically across their whole programme and not solely in the final year.
- (b) A concern that a Medal awarded on the basis of academic achievement might overlook the importance of non-academic activities, particularly when virtuoso graduates typically receive a number of awards local to their discipline or School. It was suggested that colleagues in Schools could revisit the criteria used currently for the award of local prizes and awards in the light of the introduction of a University-wide medal.
- (c) In response to a concern that awarding a Medal to the top 1% of graduates could result in a relatively high number of recipients so that it might be better to restrict the number of Medals awarded and thereby emphasise their significance it was noted that the University already had in place a range of awards and prizes for academic performance and non-academic activities but that the proposed Medal scheme was intended to recognise the most exceptional graduates from across the University. Providing one Medal per School was not consistent with this. However, it was acknowledged that it might be beneficial to reduce the threshold for award from 1% to .5%.
- (d) In response to the suggestion that the proposed prize money of £100 was low compared with other prizes awarded within the University it was noted by the Vice-President (Teaching and Learning) that this was deliberately a nominal amount.
- (e) It was acknowledged that the full use of the marking scale varied across the University according to discipline so that it was intended that Faculties would be invited to bring forward their mechanisms for nominating virtuoso graduates and that there was no intention to implement a single set of criteria across the University.

- (f) The award of a Medal would be recorded in the Higher Education Achievement Report with a descriptor setting out its significance.
- (g) In response to a suggestion that the proposal for a Learning Commons would see significant resource being made available to provide a centralised facility at the expense of facilities in Schools and that furthermore there had been insufficient consideration of the proposal by Senate the Vice-President (Teaching and Learning) explained that the Learning Commons would be an iconic building, with safe and 24/7 access, providing students with a focal point on campus and supporting the different learning styles of 21st century students. It would be impractical and prohibitively expensive to replicate such a space in different locations across the University. He had recently visited Learning Commons in America and Canada and the knowledge gained from these visits would feed into the development of the design brief for the Manchester Learning Commons. The President and Vice-President further explained that investment in the Learning Commons was not in conflict with the need to improve teaching space across the University. It was acknowledged that the opportunity for staff and students to circulate together in common space was important.

Agreed:

- (a) That the recommendation for the introduction of a Medal scheme to recognise the achievement of the most exceptional graduates annually from summer 2009 be approved but that the award be of a Manchester Medal rather than a President's Medal and be made to the top 0.5% of graduates rather than 1% as originally proposed. Additionally, the prize money attached be increased to an amount determined by the Vice-President (Teaching and Learning). *(Action: Vice-President (Teaching and Learning))*
- (b) That Senate, at its next meeting, would consider an overview of how the various awards and prizes given across the University recognise academic and non-academic achievement and whether activities such as volunteering required greater recognition. *(Action: Vice-President (Teaching and Learning))*
- (c) That Senate, at its next meeting, would consider the provision of informal teaching and learning space within each School, paying particular attention to those areas where it was considered that the quality and/or availability of such space could seriously inhibit the achievement of the goals of the Review of Undergraduate Education. *(Action: Vice-President (Teaching and Learning))*

5. Academic promotions and probationary arrangements

- (a) Academic promotions

Received: a paper setting out a proposal for the titles to be accorded to academic staff on different career tracks and different levels.

Noted:

- (i) That at its meeting in June Senate had agreed that there should be parity of esteem between teaching and research and that the University should recognise three career tracks and four promotion levels. However, there had been insufficient time at that meeting to discuss the issue of the titles to be accorded to the different levels. As the title of Reader had been linked specifically to excellence in research and the aim of the proposals was to give parity of esteem to research and teaching, it was

suggested that it would be inappropriate to use that title for the third level of promotion.

- (ii) That a consultation exercise had been undertaken which had revealed a wide range of views on titles and no obvious consensus. Therefore, it was proposed that for staff on research and teaching contracts and on teaching-focused contracts the titles be Lecturer, Associate Professor, Senior Associate Professor and Professor and for staff on research-focused contracts the titles be Research Fellow, Associate Professor, Senior Associate Professor and Professor.
- (iii) That there was an imperative for agreement to be reached so that the promotion rounds for the current academic year could proceed as scheduled.
- (iv) That an alternative model would be for staff on research and teaching contracts and on teaching-focused contracts to have the titles Lecturer, Senior Lecturer, Associate Professor and Professor and for staff on research-focused contracts to have the titles Research Fellow, Senior Research Fellow, Associate Professor and Professor.
- (vi) That since at least one other UK university used the title of Associate Professor as equivalent to Senior Lecturer there was a concern that to use Associate Professor as proposed within the paper could both lead to confusion and a devaluation of the status of this level.
- (vii) That it would be possible in exceptional circumstances for individuals to progress beyond a single level provided that the promotion criteria for the next level had been met.
- (viii) That there was some support in the meeting for the retention of the title of Reader and that its use be extended to include those staff who were promoted on the basis of their contribution to teaching. While some concern was expressed that this could disadvantage those on a teaching-focused career route it was also noted that the title of Professor had once been perceived as research-focused but that this title was now open to teaching-focused staff.

Agreed:

To approve the proposal from the meeting that the current titles of Lecturer, Senior Lecturer, Reader and Professor be retained and assigned to all staff on all three career tracks but that the operation of these titles for the three career tracks be monitored to ensure that teaching-focused staff are not disadvantaged.

(Action: Director of Human Resources)

- (b) Probationary arrangements for newly appointed academic staff

Received: a paper outlining probationary arrangements for newly appointed academic staff at Grades 6, 7 and 8.

Noted:

- (i) Some concern regarding the potential interpretation of the words 'normally' and 'typically' in paragraph 5b. It was clarified that this paragraph did include suggested figures for a reduced load in the early stages of probation at the request of UCU who expected non-reduction in load to be an exception, agreed formally and with proper justification. It was stressed that the probation policy allowed for some flexibility but that consistent management of the policy would be essential.

- (ii) That the standard period of probation was three years with a fourth year or a period shorter than three years approved only in exceptional circumstances. It was acknowledged that paragraph 3 should be redrafted to clarify this point.

Agreed:

To approve for onward transmission to the Board of Governors the probationary arrangements for newly appointed academic staff on Grades 6, 7, 8 subject to the clarifications referred to above in paragraphs 3 and 5b, and that their operation be monitored over time.
(Action: Director of Human Resources)

6. Vice-President (Research)

- (a) Changes to the Code of Practice for dealing with complaints of misconduct in research

Received: a paper detailing proposed changes to the Code of Practice for dealing with complaints of misconduct in research.

Noted:

That the need for some amendment to the current Code of Practice for dealing with complaints of misconduct in research had been highlighted by recent requirements for greater consistency with the procedure used by the UK Panel for Research Integrity in Health and Biomedical Sciences and a recognition that clarifications of some aspects of the original Code would be beneficial. The principal changes included the replacement of the Registrar and Secretary by the Vice-President (Research) as the named person to whom complaints should be reported and the inclusion of more detail regarding the role of Screeners. In addition, two key recommendations to emerge were for each Faculty to identify a senior administrator to advise respondents, complainants and witnesses involved in a case of research misconduct and that every School identify an individual who would act as a panel member should a case of research misconduct arise. It was confirmed that legal advice had been taken on the proposed changes which it was hoped would improve the efficiency with which cases would be handled. It was acknowledged that there had been instances in the past where the handling of cases had taken an inordinate amount of time. It was also confirmed that student briefings on responsible research conduct would be delivered within the framework of the doctoral training centres.

Agreed:

To approve the changes to the Code of Practice for dealing with complaints of misconduct in research as proposed, together with the specific recommendations that (i) each Faculty identify a senior administrator to advise respondents, complainants and witnesses involved in a case of research misconduct and (ii) every School identify an individual to act as a panel member should a case of research misconduct arise.

(Action: Vice-President (Research) and Head of the Research Office)

- (b) Preparation for the release of RAE results

Received and noted: a paper outlining preparations for the release of the results of RAE 2008.

7. Dates for semesters

Noted: the dates for semesters in 2012-13.

8. Matters for report to Senate

- (a) Report on exercise of delegations on behalf of Senate and the Board of Governors.

Professorial appointments

The following appointments have been approved on behalf of Senate and the Board of Governors:

Chair of Health Economics

Matthew Sutton, PhD Economics (York), MSc Health Economics (York), BA (Hons) Economics and Econometrics (Leeds), previously Chair of Health Economics at the University of Aberdeen, as Professor of Health Economics in the School of Community Based Medicine from 1 April 2008.

Chair of Medical Education

Karen Mann, PhD (Education) Dalhousie University, MSc (Health Education) Dalhousie University, BSc (Nursing) Dalhousie University, Diploma in Teaching in Schools of Nursing Dalhousie University, previously Professor of Nursing at Dalhousie University, as Professor of Medical Education in the School of Medicine from 1 September 2008.

Chair of Midwifery

Tina Lavender, PhD (John Moores), PgDip Practitioner Research (MMU), Registered General Nurse (Liverpool School of Nursing), Registered Midwife (Liverpool School of Midwifery), Royal College of Midwives (Honorary Fellow), Honorary Lecturer (Liverpool University), previously Professor of Midwifery and Women's Health at the University of Central Lancashire, as Professor of Midwifery in the School of Nursing, Midwifery and Social Work from 1 October 2008.

Chair of Molecular Pathology

Göran Landberg, MD (Umeå), PhD Pathology (Umeå), previously Research Strategist at the Department of Laboratory Medicine, UMAS, Sweden, as Professor of Molecular Pathology in the School of Medicine from 1 October 2008.

***Ad Personam* Chair in Nuclear Fuel Technology**

Timothy James Abram, BSc(UMIST), MSc(Brunel), previously Senior Fellow in Fuels and Reactor Systems at Nexia Solutions Limited in Preston, as Professor of Nuclear Fuel Technology in the School of Mechanical, Aerospace and Civil Engineering from 1 September 2008.

***Ad Personam* Promotional Chair in Organic Chemistry**

David Procter, BSc, PhD(Leeds), previously Reader in Organic Chemistry in the School of Chemistry, at this University, as Professor of Organic Chemistry in the School of Chemistry from 1 October 2008.

Ad Personam Promotional Professor of Restorative Dentistry

Hugh Devlin BDS (Bristol), BSc (Bristol), MSc (Manchester), PhD (Manchester), previously Reader at this University, as Professor of Restorative Dentistry in the School of Dentistry from 1 August 2008.

Ad Personam Promotional Professor in Surgery

Ajith Siriwardena MBChB, FRCSEd, FRCSEng, MD, FRCS Gen (Manchester), previously Honorary Reader at this University, as Honorary Professor of Surgery in the School of Medicine from 1 August 2008.

Ad Personam Promotional Professor in Radiation Biology

Catherine West BA, PhD (London), previously Senior Lecturer in Radiation Oncology at this University, as Professor of Radiation Biology in the School of Medicine from 1 August 2008.

Ad Personam Promotional Chair in Health Economics

Linda Davies BA, MSc, previously Reader in Health Economics Research at this University, as Professor of Health Economics in the School of Medicine from 1 August 2008.

Ad Personam Promotional Chair in Medicine

Rayaz Malik BSc, MSc, MB ChB, MRCP, PhD (Manchester), CCST, FRCP, previously Reader in Medicine at this University, as Professor of Medicine in the School of Medicine from 1 August 2008.

Ad Personam Promotional Chair in Psychiatry

Ian Anderson BA, MA, MB.BS, MRCP (UK), MRCPsych, MD, FRCPsych, previously Senior Lecturer in Psychiatry at this University, as Professor of Psychiatry in the School of Medicine from 1 August 2008.

Ad Personam Promotional Chair in Public Health Informatics

Iain Buchan FFHP, CCST, MFPHM, MD, DPH, MB ChB, BSc, previously Senior Lecturer in Public Health Informatics at this University, as Professor of Public Health Informatics in the School of Medicine from 1 August 2008.

Ad Personam Promotional Chair in Genetics

Gillian Wallis BSc, PhD (Cape Town), MA, previously Senior Lecturer in Genetics at this University, as Professor of Genetics in the School of Medicine from 1 August 2008.

Ad Personam Promotional Chair in Medical Education

Caroline Boggis MB, BS, FRCR, PGCTHE, MRCP, at present Associate Director for the Curriculum at this University, as Professor of Medical Education in the School of Medicine from 1 August 2008.

Ad Personam Promotional Chair in Psychiatry and Population Health

Navneet Kapur MB, ChB, MRCPsych, MMedSc, MD, previously Reader in Psychiatry at this University, as Professor of Psychiatry and Population Health in the School of Medicine from 1 August 2008.

Grant of the title of Professor Emeritus

Acting on behalf of Senate and the Board of Governors, the President and Vice-Chancellor has approved the conferment of the title of Professor Emeritus on the following:

Professor Peter Heggs, Professor of Chemical Engineering (in the School of Chemical Engineering and Analytical Science) (*from 1 August 2008*).

Professor Harold Somers, Professor of Language Engineering (in the School of Computer Science) (*from 1 October 2008*).

- (b) Report on exercise of delegations on behalf of Senate
- (i) Acting on behalf of Senate, the President and Vice-Chancellor has approved the following regulations:

Egyptian Mummy Research Fund

Established in 1991, with sums derived from book royalties (£4,000) paid to the Mummy Team in respect of a book that was written by the team members (A.R. David and E. Tapp (eds.), *The Mummy's Tale: the scientific and medical investigation of Natsef-Amun, Priest in the Temple of Karnak* (London: Michael O'Mara Books 1992), and payments made by Leeds City Council (£8,000) to members of the Manchester Mummy Team in respect of a major research project that the team undertook on the "Leeds Mummy" in the City of Leeds City Museum. The University agreed to hold these sums on behalf of the Team in a fund for the Manchester Mummy team's continuing research.

REGULATIONS

- The funds from the account are to be used specifically and exclusively for the Manchester Mummy project's ongoing research, carried out by the Manchester Mummy Team in the KNH Centre for Biomedical Egyptology.
 - The income (and with the approval of the Manchester Mummy Team) the capital is to be used to meet the Team's funding requirements for research or related agreed purposes, including the establishment of postgraduate studentships in Biomedical Egyptology.
- (ii) Acting on behalf of Senate, the President and Vice-Chancellor has approved the following changes to the General Regulation XVII (*Conduct and Discipline of Students*) listed below:

Delete: "Head/s of Residence" throughout.

Amend: paragraph 29 (ii) concerning the composition of the Appeal Panel to read '... [Note: the panel shall comprise the Residences General Manager for Pastoral

Care, a Warden (not directly connected to the Residence concerned) and a nominee of the Head of Student Support and Services].

- (c) New undergraduate, postgraduate taught and research programmes

The following new and amended undergraduate and taught postgraduate programmes have been approved by Faculties, and ratified by the Vice-President (Teaching and Learning), and the research postgraduate programmes have been approved by the Associate Vice-President (Graduate Education) during the 2007-08 session. Unless otherwise shown, the programmes will start in the 2008-09 session.

Faculty of Engineering and Physical Sciences

Undergraduate

BSc Honours Actuarial Science and Mathematics, full-time.

Postgraduate

MSc Biotechnology, full-time or part-time

MSc Advanced Chemical Engineering, full-time or part-time

MSc Chemical Engineering with Design, full-or part-time

MSc Electrical Energy and Conversion Systems, full-time or part-time

MSc Nanoelectronics, full-time.

MSc (by research) Advanced Aerospace Materials Engineering

Faculty of Humanities

Undergraduate

BA Honours Management and Information Systems (with specialism in Management), full-time

BA Honours Accounting, Management and Information Systems (with specialism in Accounting), full-time.

Postgraduate

MA Ancient World Studies, full-time or part-time, title change to MA Classics and Ancient History, addition of a new pathway Greek Myth and Society; withdrawal of pathway Song, Text and Performance

*MA/Postgraduate Diploma Art Business, full-time, addition of a part-time entry route (collaborative programme with Sotheby's Institute of Art, Singapore)

Business Administration Global MBA, part-time, addition of two specified study routes:

BP Project Executives; Commercial Executives

MA Contemporary Literature and Culture,- full-time or part-time

MA Counselling Studies, full-time or part-time, addition of full-time and part-time non accredited entry route to shorter length programme (from September 2009)

*MEd Communication, Education and Technology, full-time or part-time, change of mode of delivery to blended learning (collaborative programme with Moscow School of Social Sciences and Economics, Russia)

MSc Decision Science and Operational Research, full-time, title change to MSc Analytics: Operational Research and Risk Analysis

*MA Digital Live Arts (Performance Video), full-time (collaborative programme with Rose Bruford College, Sidcup, Kent)

MA Education with Qualified Teacher Status, full-time or part-time, title change to MA Education

MA Health Care Ethics and Law, part-time, modification of distance learning mode of study

Master of Laws (LLM) International Business Law, full-time or part-time, title change to International

Business and Commercial Law (from September 2009)

MA Law and Development, full-time or part-time

MSc Managing Global Operations, full-time, title change to MSc Operations, Project and Supply Chain Management (from September 2009)

MSc Management and Information Systems: Change and Development, full-time or part-time, addition of a distance learning mode (from September 2010)

*MA Mission, full-time or part-time, with seven pathways, Emerging Church; Evangelism; Leadership (collaborative programme with Cliff College, Sheffield)

and Renewal; Wesleyan Theology and Spirituality; World of Work; Religious Pluralism

MSc Poverty and Development, full-time

MSc/PG Diploma Social Research Methods and Statistics, full-time or part-time, amendments as follows:

- 1) ending the option of a non-research training route through the programme;
- 2) requirement that applicants have a basic level of statistical knowledge, equivalent to that of statistics as part of an A level in mathematics;
- 3) suspension for 2008-09 of the Demography pathway of the degree, and probable withdrawal subsequently;
- 4) removal of separate streams for research methods and social statistics.

Postgraduate Certificate Supervision of Counselling and the Helping Professions, part-time, change of length of programme

*Postgraduate Certificate Writing for Performance, full-time, (collaborative programme with The Manchester College) (from January 2009).

Faculty of Life Sciences

Postgraduate

MSc Biotechnology and Enterprise, full-time.

Faculty of Medical and Human Sciences

Postgraduate

MSc Clinical Rheumatology, part-time, addition of Postgraduate Diploma as an exit route

Postgraduate Diploma Cognitive Therapy part-time, change of title to Postgraduate

Diploma Cognitive and Behavioural Therapies, addition of two pathways: Cognitive Therapy; Cognitive and Behaviour Therapy

Master of Public Health (MPH), full-time or part-time, addition of two pathways, Global Health;

Emergency Humanitarian Assistance and Global Health.

* indicates collaborative or joint programme

- (d) Election of members of Senate to serve on the Planning and Resources Committee and on the Board of Governors.

Noted:

That Professor Stephen Williamson has been re-elected to serve as a member of the Planning and Resources Committee from 1 September 2008 until 31 August 2011 and that Dr Anne McBride has been elected to serve on the Board of Governors from 1 September 2008 until 31 August 2011.

9. Any other business

There was no other business.