Final Report

THE AUSTRIAN NAP 2000
FROM A GENDER PERSPECTIVE

Ulli Pastner
FORBA Research Report
Final Report

THE AUSTRIAN NAP 2000
FROM A GENDER PERSPECTIVE

Ulli Pastner
FORBA Research Report

Translated by Sabine Kirschenhofer

Vienna - May 2000

Report for the EU-Group of Experts "Gender and Employment",
co-ordinated by Jill Rubery and the UMIST co-ordinating team for the
Equal Opportunities Unit, DG V, Commission of the European Union

FORBA - Forschungs- und Beratungsstelle Arbeitswelt

Working Life Research Center
Aspernbrückengasse 4/5, A-1020 Vienna
Tel: +43 1 21 24 700-75
Fax: +43 1 21 24 700-77
www.forba.at
pastner@forba.at
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

**EXECUTIVE SUMMARY** .......................................................................................................................... III

**SOME BASIC REMARKS** ........................................................................................................................ 1

1. **THE GENDER EQUALITY DEFICIT AND THE NEED FOR ACTION** ...................................................... 1

2. **ASSESSING THE IMPLEMENTATION OF GENDER MAINSTREAMING** ............................................ 5

   The NAP 2000 came about differently as in the year before .................................................................... 5

   2.1. Monitoring and evaluation .................................................................................................................. 6

   2.2. Initiatives to promote gender equality ............................................................................................... 9

   2.3. Coherence and consistency in the gender mainstreaming approach .................................................. 13

   2.4. Mechanisms for implementing gender mainstreaming ...................................................................... 14

3. **ASSESSING THE PRIORITY ACCORDED TO GENDER EQUALITY** .................................................. 16

4. **PRIORITY AREAS FOR FUTURE ACTION AND IDENTIFICATION OF BEST PRACTICE** ........... 18

**REFERENCES** ............................................................................................................................................ 22

**ANNEX**
LIST OF TABLES, FIGURES AND BOXES

TABLE 1: SUMMARY TABLE - LIST OF MEASURES IN AUSTRIAN 2000 NAP BY OBJECTIVES

BOX 1: NAP 2000, PART II, CHAPTER II.1.2. RECOMMENDATION ON NARROWING THE GENDER GAP

BOX 2: BEST PRACTISE I, ESTABLISHMENT OF AN INTER-DEPARTMENTAL WORKING GROUP ON GENDER MAINSTREAMING IN THE FORMER AUSTRIAN FEDERAL MINISTRY OF LABOUR, HEALTH AND SOCIAL AFFAIRS

BOX 3: BEST PRACTISE II, ACCOMPANYING EVALUATION OF THE AUSTRIAN NAP ON EQUAL OPPORTUNITIES UND MAINSTREAMING

TABLE 2: EMPLOYEES BY SEX 1990 – 1999

FIGURE 1: UNEMPLOYMENT BY SEX 1987 - 1999

FIGURE 2: THE MEAN NET INCOME OF EMPLOYEES IN 1997

FIGURE 3: GENDER-SPECIFIC UNEMPLOYMENT RATES ACCORDING TO EDUCATION* AND AGE GROUPS

BOX A1: EXAMPLES OF POLICIES CONSISTENT WITH PROACTIVE GENDER MAINSTREAMING. - IN AUSTRIAN NAP 2000 CONSIDERED?

BOX A2: NAP 1999, GL 19 – ADOPTING A GENDER-MAINSTREAMING APPROACH

BOX A3: IMPLEMENTATION REPORT 1999, GENDER MAINSTREAMING AS A HORIZONTAL SUBJECT AREA

BOX A4: IMPLEMENTATION REPORT 2000, GL 18 - ADOPTING A GENDER-MAINSTREAMING APPROACH

BOX A5: NAP 2000, NEW MEASURES FOR IMPLEMENTING THE GUIDELINES 2000 AND NEW POLICY INITIATIVES*

BOX A6: "ANLAGE 2", EXAMPLE FOR A GENDER MAINSTREAMING ACTION (APPENDIX OF A LETTER FROM THE FORMER FMLHS TO THE SOCIAL PARTNERS)
Executive Summary

The subject of this paper is the evaluation of the gender dimension of the Austrian NAP. After some introductory words on Austria’s current political situation ("Some basic remarks") the first chapter deals with "the gender equality deficit and the need for action". There we find that women can gain by the recent economical development. In 1999 there was an increasing in employment and - as a new trend after many years - a decreasing of unemployment. Despite this positive development gender equality on the labour market has not improved in the nineties; this is indicated by the development of the wage gap. Because of the new political situation in Austria chapter 2 "Assessing the implementation of gender mainstreaming" is introduced by some words regarding the changes in the establishing procedures of the NAP 2000. Further various points of this chapter are "Monitoring and Evaluation" (in Austria an accompanying evaluation is set also for the subject equal opportunities and mainstreaming!), "Initiatives to promote gender equality" (despite some progress there is in this field still a big inconsistency in the Austrian NAP), "Coherence and consistency in the gender mainstreaming approach" (one could summarize the Austrian approach as "women should work but not neglect their family", which leads to some crucial contradictions in policies) and last but not least there is a consideration of a very important issue "Mechanisms for implementing gender mainstreaming". Chapter 3 "Assessing the priority accorded to gender equality" shows that one has to differentiate by institutional boundaries; good practise for example is to be found in the Public Employment Service [PES] and in the field of the ESF-programme. A very important precondition for authentic mainstreaming in politics is an organisational culture that has installed the gender aspect as such. In the last chapter "Priority areas for future action and identification of best practice" are given. I think that procedures and evaluation/ monitoring are as important as the contents of the NAP. Selected best practise examples are therefore "the establishment of an inter-departmental working group on gender mainstreaming in the former Austrian Federal Ministry of Labour, Health and Social Affairs [FMLHS]" and an "accompanying evaluation of the Austrian NAP on equal opportunities and mainstreaming". As a final statement it must be said that the new political situation is a big instability factor regarding progress in equal opportunity policy and the future alone will show what this means for Austrian women - within and outside the labour market.

In the Austrian NAP there is the overall target of increasing labour force participation of women and the general objective of reducing the unemployment among women and lowering it down to that of men (in 2002 it should be reduced to 3.5% for both women and men). In the paper one can find a lot of statements on women’s issues but these are of a very varying quality (most of them are listed in the summary table below). Main policies for women are active labour market measures by the PES (counselling, education and training programmes, etc.) and the improvement of childcare facilities to meet the enormous deficits in this field.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>OBJECTIVES</th>
<th>List of Measures in Austrian 2000 NAP*</th>
<th>(i)</th>
<th>(ii)</th>
<th>(iii)</th>
<th>(iv)</th>
<th>(v)</th>
<th>(vi)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Employment promotion (job creation etc)</td>
<td>• overall target of increasing labour force participation of women</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• employment subsidies of the PES to foster employment in social and care services (GL12 and GL20)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• see also the overview of measures in Box1 (chapter 2.2), Recommendation on narrowing the gender gap (NAP 2000)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tax and benefit system (incentives for participation etc)</td>
<td>• flexibilisation of parental leave schemes (GL20)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Measures for the employed</td>
<td>• for young people: &quot;safety net&quot; (GL1, 8)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• training measures for women within adult education programmes (GL6)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• see also the overview of measures in Box1 (chapter 2.2), Recommendation on narrowing the gender gap (NAP 2000)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Measures for the unemployed</td>
<td>• general objective of reducing the unemployment among women and lowering down to that of men (2002 it should be reduced to 3.5% for both women and men)</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>counselling, skill training measures, job creation within the following GL: (summary in GL 19)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• New start for young people (GL1)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Fresh start for long-term unemployed adults (GL2)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Increasing the number of people benefiting from active labour market measures (GL3)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• see also the overview of measures in Box1 (chapter 2.2), Recommendation on narrowing the gender gap (NAP 2000)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Measures for the inactive and returners</td>
<td>• women returner programme by the PES (GL21)</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• (re-)integrating of disabled people only in the context of new objective 3, ESF (GL9)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OBJECTIVES</td>
<td>List of Measures in Austrian 2000 NAP*</td>
<td>(i)</td>
<td>(ii)</td>
<td>(iii)</td>
<td>(iv)</td>
<td>(v)</td>
<td>(vi)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>-----</td>
<td>------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Entrepreneurship</td>
<td>• counselling and establishment of single new business start-up centres for women (Gründerinnen-Zentren) (GL11)</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adaptablety</td>
<td>nearly no gender aspect in this important pillar • only encouraging of part-time work in the public sector (GL16)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gender mainstreaming</td>
<td>progress within following institutions: • PES • ESF • in the former FMLHS (working group) • partly in other ministries (see chapter 2.4)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Desegregation</td>
<td>• single programmes and initiatives as &quot;girls/women in technology&quot; (GL7) or promotion of girls in non traditional apprenticed trades (GL19) • see also the overview of measures in Box1 (chapter 2.2), Recommendation on narrowing the gender gap (NAP 2000)</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pay</td>
<td>• counselling and information campaigns (see the overview of measures in Box1 (chapter 2.2), Recommendation on narrowing the gender gap (NAP 2000))</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parental leave</td>
<td>• flexibilisation of parental leave schemes (GL20) • see also the overview of measures in Box1 (chapter 2.2), Recommendation on narrowing the gender gap (NAP 2000)</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OBJECTIVES</td>
<td>List of Measures in Austrian 2000 NAP*</td>
<td>(i)</td>
<td>(ii)</td>
<td>(iii)</td>
<td>(iv)</td>
<td>(v)</td>
<td>(vi)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>-----</td>
<td>------</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Care (children, elderly, other) | • statutory pension insurance scheme for care-givers who care for a close relative (GL 12)  
• childcare benefits and granted subsidies to childcare facilities by the PES (GL20)  
• extension of childcare facilities (in the context of the second tranche of the so-called kindergarten billion (Kindergarten-milliard) ) (GL20) | x   | x    | x     | x    |     | x    |
| Other family friendly measures | • single projects on fostering equal opportunities at company level (GL19)  
• see also the overview of measures in Box1 (chapter 2.2), Recommendation on narrowing the gender gap (NAP 2000) | x   |     |       | x    |     | x    |

(i) gender impact taken into account in the design  
(ii) aimed at improving the process of gender mainstreaming  
(iii) monitored for gender impact  
(iv) aimed at closing gender gaps  
(v) aimed at improving the reconciliation of work and family life  
(vi) aimed at allowing women and men to return to the labour market

*with regard to the naming of individual GL see Box A5 in the annex.
Some basic remarks

We all know that Austria has a new government; since February a coalition of the conservative ÖVP and the far-right populist FPÖ is in power. In their coalition paper they have agreed upon several measures which are of big influence on both the situation of women and the situation of employees in our country, for example the abolition of the position of the Minister of Women’s Affairs, a new concept for parental leave (also the lengthening of the period), raising the retirement age for early retirement schemes or – as a new measure of labour market policy - the workfare for long-term unemployed persons. The new government claims that there are no conflicts of interests between work and capital. Thus the agendas of labour market policy, labour protection and labour law were shifted from the Ministry of Labour, Health and Social Affairs to the Ministry of Economic Affairs now called Ministry of Economic Affairs and Labour ("Ministerium für Wirtschaft und Arbeit").

Crucial cuts in social benefits and a general weakening of employees’ interests plus reducing the influence of the social partnership at a simultaneous extension of employers’ interests can be expected. Equal opportunity policy could be replaced by a family policy which is oriented towards traditional gender-specific role models.

The following explanations must be seen against this background. Austria’s situation right now is determined by political uncertainty and faces – should this government remain in power – massive political changes, which will have significant consequences on the labour market and the lives of employees in general. Thus the future, in particular for women, is entirely uncertain.

1. The gender equality deficit and the need for action

Since 1997 the situation of women in the labour market is characterized – even more than in the years before – by an increased labour force growth. On the one hand this leads towards a visible rising of employment (see Table 2), on the other hand towards increasing unemployment. In the years 1997 and 1998 the total growth of the annual average of unemployment was due to women to an extent of about 80%.

Since the beginning of 1999 though a new trend on the labour market is talked about; for women (more than for men) there was a substantially decrease in unemployment (see Figure 1). Although this improvement in the unemployment rates of women partly can be attributed

---

1 The equal opportunity policy was transferred to the newly organized "Ministry of Social Security and Generations".
2 A ministry with exactly this name already existed in Austria in 1938 when the National Socialists came to power; this naming shows little historical sensitivity.
3 In 1999 the national unemployment rate at 6.7% (women: 6.9%, men: 6.5%) was the lowest since 1995!
to the following two circumstances: Firstly women have been included more intensively into training programmes by the Public Employment Service [PES] (a very positive development but this partly leads also to their invisibility in the unemployment statistics⁴), secondly the increased unemployment of women in 1998 was partly due to the cut in parental leave benefits (shortage of period). The latter circumstance had ceased to have effects in the year 1999.

Predominantly middle-aged women change their labour market behaviour and pursue gainful employment in spite of children. The strong growth of part-time employment correlates with this development because reduced working hours in Austria are one of the few possibilities of combining work and family. Thus the full-time employment rate of women has been decreasing continually in recent years (see EC 1999) and the employment increase of the year 1999 can be put down to part-time jobs (estimated) in two third of the cases.

Another form of atypical employment is marginal employment, employees with a monthly income below ATS 3,830 (ECU 280) belong to this category. Their numbers have increased dramatically over the last few years and reached 189,000 in 1999. About three quarters of them were women.⁵

It must be added here that those forms of atypical employment are far beyond a living wage, and therefore imply traditional family forms (bread winner model). Furthermore employment possibilities with reduced working hours are concentrated in a few sectors (wholesale and retail trade, cleaning, hotel and restaurants) and thus located in predominantly unattractive, badly paid labour market segments without promotion prospects.

Therefore the quantitative growth in employment opportunities for women cannot be equated with a corresponding increase in quality. And gender inequality on the labour market is not reduced that way, on the contrary, the income development of recent years points at the fact that the relative position of women (compared to men) has deteriorated.

Austria belongs to the group of countries with the highest wage gaps between men and women. Thus in 1997 men earned on average around 47% more than women or, in other words, female net incomes are about 68% of those of men⁶ (see Figure 2). This gender wage gap decreased in the course of the ‘80s but increased significantly in the ‘90s, especially among white-collar workers. Compared to other EU-countries Austria’s employment rates of women are among the best.

---

⁴ According to estimations the statistically registered unemployment (for Vienna) in 1999 is underestimated by a third because of the reinforced training measures.

⁵ Marginally employed were not covered by social security (no retirement, unemployment or health insurance) until the end of 1997, but their legal situation has improved since then. Marginally employed people are now in a position to insure themselves voluntarily (retirement and health insurance). This however means a serious reduction of income and many persons do not use the new possibility.

⁶ This data does not take into account part-time work. It has been estimated that about a third of the gender-specific wage gap can be attributed to the higher proportion of women in part-time work (see BMAGS 2000).
But if the gender gaps in employment and unemployment are taken into account, Austria’s position loses its prominent place at the top (see Leitner/Wroblewski 2000). In 1998 the gender gap in employment was 26%, also the female unemployment rate (5.6%) was still above the male one (3.6%) (EC 1999).

In Austria childcare still is the responsibility of mothers, reflecting the traditional division of labour according to gender-specific role models. Following traditional values infants in particular are supposed to spend their first three years at home in the care of their mothers. From their third year onwards it is socially acceptable, largely on pedagogical grounds, to send children to half-day kindergartens. Although more and more mothers no longer want to comply with these traditional stereotypes, public childcare facilities still fail to cater to the needs of working mothers. There is a lot of talking going on about the extension of childcare facilities and extending institutional childcare is one of the key areas of flanking measures within the NAP, but especially in rural areas the deficits are hardly changing. (The fact that the care of the elderly also hinders women considerably in their gainful working life so far is not discussed in public.)

Thus the birth of children is one of the main reasons why women are barred from enjoying similar employment careers as men. It is largely women who are forced to interrupt their careers and who are faced with negative consequences in terms of a loss of qualifications and earning power. Dropping out of the labour market for years is promoted by parental leave regulations that are tuned to traditional family forms.

The involvement of women in decision-making still is weak. Since men don’t feel responsible for women’s issues – they view the discrimination against women as women’s problems and not as a social problem – the interests of women in politics and the economy are scarcely pursued. The term "mainstreaming" is used more and more often in political speeches but only serves as a legitimation of the prevailing interests (like in the case of the elimination of the position of the Minister of Women’s Affairs).

Special problems on the labour market are – as some of the data of the PES show (see Figure 3) – faced by women with children and care duties (in the last years the number of "hard-to-place" unemployed women has been increasing very much); lone mothers; elderly women (their positions will be getting even worse because of changes in the early retirement schemes); women with poor education; job returners; women with reduced working hours (and therefore reduced income and little job prospects); female migrant workers without Austrian citizenship; and young women coming directly from schools/colleges.

7 This value is standardized by the male employment rate. Regarding the total employment rates the rates of men and women differed around 21%-points, for full-time employment around 29%-points.
8 1998 28.8% of all female unemployed had restrictions in mobility. This is closely connected to a supply shortage of childcare facilities and changes in parental leave regulations.
The political context in which gender equality policies are operating at present was already mentioned above. The economic development has been favourable in the last few years. In 1998 the real GDP growth was 3.3%, this was the highest rate since 1991. At the beginning of the economic upturn in 1997 the number of employees increased by 8,000, then there was a further increase of 21,000 or +0.7% in 1998. Women benefitted from this development over-proportionally (women: +16,300, 1.2%; men: +4,800, 0.3%). Also the rising number of self-employed persons can be put down mainly to women. This general positive development in employment continued from 1998 to 1999 (see Table 2).

Differentiated according to sectors it turns out that 24,600 of the total 33,000 (75%) additional employees in the service sector in 1998 were women. Simultaneously 84% of the increase in female unemployment could be found in the tertiary sector. Industries with higher increases in employment are "business services", "wholesale and retail trade" and "other public and private services". Especially the first two fields have high shares of part-time employment. Decreasing employment could be found in "construction", "textiles and clothing", and "food, drink and tobacco", the last two sectors with high proportions of women.

The educational level of women gets higher and higher. In high-qualified segments however women encounter barriers at times. New organisational trends bringing along more flexibility (very long working hours) and mobility can be managed by young women without family but only with great difficulty or hardly by women with care duties. In addition, women don’t really profit from the growth of employment in well-paid technical segments because of the relatively stable segregation in the educational and employment system. A further trend is the decline of regular employment contracts. More and more people work as free-lancers, involuntarily self-employed or in personnel leasing firms.

Highly skilled women could profit from employment growth in education, health and social services - areas that in parts are affected by public cost-cutting. Thus the job opportunities in some fields of the public service have worsened considerably – like in public administration and at universities – in recent years.

As mentioned at the beginning the present political situation in Austria is characterized by great uncertainty. Therefore it is difficult to name the need for action on equal opportunities. Certainly the opposite of what’s happening now should be happening. Not the dismantling of equal opportunity units but an improvement is asked for, not the individualisation of socially important care work at the expense of women but the compatibility of work and family for women and men and an extension of public institutions for care are necessary. Not the extension of family policy benefits but policies aiming at an independent securing of women’s livelihoods would be appropriate. Finally the weakening of employees’ rights will

---

9 The latter would also create new employment for women.
concern women in particular since they are over-represented in the lower levels of the labour market.

2. Assessing the implementation of gender mainstreaming

At first some principal remarks about this year’s process of emergence of the Austrian NAP 2000 are necessary to ensure better understanding.

*The NAP 2000 came about differently as in the year before*

Whereas the Austrian NAP 1998 more or less was a reaction to the demands from Brussels, the NAP 1999 was integrated into national employment policy and made governmental matter. Comprehensive public relations work (radio commercials, a NAP-website, a great deal of events etc.) on the one hand and attempts of creating a very large basis for the realization showed that employment policy in Austria had again become a priority aim of economic policy. The NAP was edited by two ministries (Federal Ministry of Labour, Health and Social Affairs [FMLHS] and Federal Ministry of Economic Affairs), the main part of the coordinating work lay within the FMLHS. The social partners, regional participants, and several department ministries (like the Federal Ministry of Education and Cultural Affairs; Federal Ministry of Science; Federal Minister of Women’s Affairs) were intensively involved in the preparation and discussion processes.

In view of the current political development the interest in the NAP 2000 cannot be compared to last year’s. The proceeding was essentially simplified, and the decision processes were not accompanied by top-level discussions like in the year before. The paper was worked out on a low political level and under great pressure of time presented to the social partners for commentary. The changes in the division of ministries (as mentioned above) were made on the 1st of April 2000, which fell precisely into the preparation phase. While up to the 1st of April the preparation was dealt with in yet unchanged structure – thus for instance the Office of the Minister of Women’s Affairs was officially involved – the completion was already carried out in the new Ministry of Economic Affairs and Labour. Thereby the former double structure of two ministries was abolished. Before the governmental restructuring the FMLHS led by Social Democrats (SPÖ) was in charge of the NAP together with the conservatively leaded (ÖVP) Federal Ministry for Economic Affairs, the NAP-affairs now lie exclusively with the new (ÖVP) Minister for Economic Affairs and Labour. Hence the social partners of the employers now have a far greater impact than before. Within one ministry there now are two departments responsible for the NAP, in which a division of labour was made according to guidelines. Because of the new situation there is a general shifting of power and
competences which also effect the NAP-process. NAP-experts leave the ministry, planned projects for implementation are not realized any more, priorities are set anew. Analysing these influences and their consequences as regards content would be worth a study for political science, which no authority will pay for. Consequences on women’s politics surely are given, not least because the former FMLHS had a fairly great supporter of gender mainstreaming and women’s interests in Minister Hostasch, and the Ministry for Economic Affairs – now lead by the former Minister for Family Affairs – stands for women’s politics of an entirely different culture and with very differing goals as the former FMLHS. In addition, the governmental restructuring has - among circles of the women’s movement as well as among representatives of equal opportunity units - triggered as a first reaction not only resistance but also frustration and disorientation; it will take some time until business as usual again returns to large parts of the administration. Thus the making of the current NAP played a relatively small role on a general as well as women’s political level, and it remains to be seen how strongly the Austrian employment policy will continue to be co-ordinated with the EU-process.

At present a rather paradoxical situation has set in: On the one hand Austria’s new government is confronted with European sanctions, on the other hand some of the planned fundamental political changes (like in Retirement and Tax Law) are indeed meeting the demands of EU-policy. Precisely these measures however are fiercely disputed within Austria. Generally it can be said that in the NAP 2000 special importance has been given to complying with the recommendations of the EU (see EC 2000). This has also been beneficial to women – at least on paper – as will be demonstrated in the following report.

2.1. Monitoring and evaluation

The great importance which has been measured out for the NAP-process of 1998/1999, is indicated by the accompanying evaluations being commissioned. Thus Austrian research institutes, among them the ERI – Economic Research Institute (WIFO – Wirtschaftsforschungsinstitut), the IHS – Institute for Advanced Studies (Institut für Höhere Studien), and Synthesis followed the implementation with the following objectives:

"- to analyse and evaluate the action of the individual measures and instruments;
- to document, analyse and evaluate the effect of the various measures of the NAP on employment as well as on the level and structuring of unemployment;
- to enlist the use of effect-analysis for suggestions for the further development or modification of measures, instruments and individual parts of the programme;
- to identify efficiency and effectiveness of the NAP in the overall context of the economic policies." (Implementation Report for 1999:7)

10 The contracts with the institutes are finished at present, in the coalition paper of the new government, however, a continuation of the NAP-evaluation is agreed with.
The evaluation was worked upon in several studies having a differing main focus. One of them was the study "Equal opportunities for women and men and gender mainstreaming – Results of the accompanying evaluation of the Austrian NAP", carried out by Andrea Leitner and Angela Wroblewski (see Leitner/Wroblewski 2000) in the Institute for Advanced Studies. The results of the 100-page report, which in the course of this paper will flow in repeatedly, "...mainly focus on qualification measures for unemployed women and improvements for childcare facilities, on the consideration of gender mainstreaming in other policy areas as well as macro economic effects on employment and unemployment of women. It shows that the promotion of qualification measures and childcare facilities increases the activity rate of women. Although there remain doubts about the quality and sustainability of many measures." (Leitner/Wroblewski 2000, Abstract)

Further sections of the report deal with the methodology of evaluation and possible indicators regarding equal opportunities as well as a detailed analysis of the labour market situation of women (among others with wage gap and labour market segregation).

In addition, other institutes evaluated several gender-specific policies. The results were also used in the account of "Effect of the National Action Plan for Employment" in 1999,

"With the kindergarten funding package (federal and Land funds) and the child-care assistance of the PES [Public Employment Service], around 12,500 women were able in 1998 to take up a job they would have been denied without both these measures. These measures aim to make increased use of child-care facilities, with the direct effect amounting to around 2,500 jobs and the 'indirect' effect, i.e. enabling one to take up a job through sponsored child-care, amounting to around 10,000 jobs. Therefore, on an annual average for 1998, unemployment figures for women fell by around 8,400, more than would have been the case without these measures."

(Implementation Report for 1999:4)

Although other experts and social scientists criticize the figures of Synthesis as too optimistic, such figure estimates are popular with decision makers since it can be demonstrated very simply how effectively public funds are used.

When we look at the responses to gender-specific evaluation or monitoring, it can be said that the concrete figures on gender gap in employment and unemployment seem to impress some politicians (also on higher levels). Regarded in this way the form of representation of gender equality is of great importance. In general though - until now - the evaluation studies don’t appear to have any significant influence on the NAP-policy.

On the part of the EU the Austrian NAP 1998 was called best-practice-example because of its consideration of the gender aspect. Equal opportunities are mainly taken into account in the

---

11 From 1998 to 2000 four reports were made by WIFO and IHS; the last report was: "Begleitende Bewertung der Umsetzung des Nationalen Aktionsplanes für Beschäftigung im Jahr 1999 (accompanying assessment of the implementation of the NAP in 1999), February 2000.

12 At this point I want to thank Andrea Leitner kindly for letting me have her just finished evaluation summary.

areas active labour market policy and qualification. Therein the Public Employment Service [PES] plays a central role. The goals of the National Action Plan can also be found in the PES’s scheduled objectives for labour market policy. Women’s difficulties are in this paper considered under several aspects (qualification and reintegration problems). There gender-specific monitoring also is important:

"Not least for assessing the contribution of labour market policy in promoting women’s equality of opportunity on the labour market, it appears indispensable to show indicators for planning as well as detailed results in a gender-specific form." (BMAGS 1998:5)

Monitoring problems related to gaps in the availability of statistics have decreased since the first NAP. Particularly statistics disaggregated by gender are given in most cases. Although in the statistical annexes of the NAPs of 1999 and 2000 women are not referred to separately in all the tables, in many explanations in the written passages – especially concerning labour market data – women are referred to separately.

Still, a lot remains to be done, as is quoted in the Implementation Report 2000,

"The creation of suitable instruments and methods for gender-related data collection systems and procedures is under way in some areas (such as AMS [PES] and school statistics), whereas other bodies (such as the federal computing centre, the social insurance carriers or the public work accident insurance institution) still require more fine-tuning." (Implementation Report 2000:22)

Besides, the figures are used very differently. Whereas for instance in some guidelines (GL 1-3, 19-21)\textsuperscript{14} of the Implementation Report 2000 the exact participant numbers - also by gender - are given for the effected programmes, merely general descriptions of measures and no concrete details whatsoever can be found in other guidelines (for example GL 6 and 7).

Since many indicators do not fully do justice to the situation of women, the principle usage of the data also can be critisized. Thus, on the one hand no satisfactory data for the description of the (gender-specific) income situation are existent in Austria, on the other hand it is difficult to describe the quality of women’s employment with indicators. Part-time employment, for instance, would have to be depicted far more differentiately (different extent, connection with income and stability of employment, working conditions) or the reduction of women’s unemployment would have to be illuminated more accurately (whether for example training, stable reintegration or dropping out into inactivity is the case).

Throughout the action programme the disaggregation and the monitoring of targets by gender is – in so far as concrete targets or numbers are listed at all – given throughout large parts. In the NAP 1999 even gender-specific targets could be found in the budget for labour market measures. These targets are continued also in the year 2000. New and concrete gender-specific targets are not given in the NAP 2000.

\textsuperscript{14} with regard to the naming of individual GL see Box A5 in the annex.
2.2. Initiatives to promote gender equality

It is hard to follow the given work programme in assessing the implementation of gender mainstreaming. It is difficult to divide measures of the Austrian NAP according to firstly the fulfilling or not of the minimum requirement for gender mainstreaming (ensuring that new policies and initiatives are not likely to exacerbate gender gaps); secondly any measures which are at best likely not to increase gender inequalities (defensive approach of gender mainstreaming) and thirdly any initiatives which are potentially consistent with a proactive approach to gender mainstreaming (having a gender equality promoting approach) (see Rubery 1999). In Box A1 the attempt was made to check for the Austrian NAP the possible existence of examples of "Policies consistent with proactive gender mainstreaming", which were suggested in the work programme (see annex). In the course of this it became apparent that many of the suggested examples are not considered at all, others in some parts, only in starting-points, or far too generally formulated. Without restrictions it has to be viewed as positive that the general objective for 2002 for the unemployment has been formulated as getting close to 3.5% and that applies to both women and men.

Austria is one of the few countries that already in the NAP 1998 explicitly took up the concept of mainstreaming and not only in pillar 4 went into the problems of women (see Pastner 1998). In the new GL 19 in the NAP 1999 the definition of the European Council was taken over,

"In accordance with the definition adopted by the Council of Europe in 1998, gender mainstreaming in the National Action Plan is considered to be ‘(re)organisation, improvement, development and evaluation of policy processes, so that a gender equality perspective is incorporated in all policies at all levels and at all stages, by the actors normally involved in policy-making.’" (NAP 1999:42)

and vividly pointed out the necessity of realizing this concept. As concrete examples for the realization GL 3 and GL 11 were named (see Box A2 in the annex, where GL 19 is given in full length). In the Implementation Report 1999 gender mainstreaming is finally treated as the first of four horizontal topical areas (see Box A3 in the annex). Also gender mainstreaming is mentioned at respectively prominent place in the introductory passages and therefore it can be assumed that it is still taken seriously. It has however not been possible to realize the concept systematically, which is also described by the evaluators (of NAP 1998 and NAP 1999):

"Due to the pursuit of the mainstreaming concept in the Austrian NAP a series of suggestions for the improvement of the employment situation of women have been introduced and in particular sharpened the problem consciousness regarding the specific situation of women on the labour market. Yet in the Austrian NAP – as well as in other countries – the tracking of

---

15 This whole report follows the structure of the work programme made by the UMIST team and was discussed in a meeting by the expert group and representatives of the EC.
mainstreaming in a systematic fashion, as intended by definition, has not been successful."
(Leitner/Wroblewski 2000:5)

For large parts of the NAP 1999 – despite some improvements – the same argument as for the
NAP 1998 is valid:

"There is a general scarcity of quantifiable - and hence verifiable - indicators and this situation
is often exacerbated by vague wording that has the character of a declaration of intent that
avoids any concrete plan of action." (Pastner 1998:16)

Positive exceptions are in particular GL 1 to 3, in which the consideration of the gender aspect
has been made in an exemplary manner with regard to the depiction of the problem, the
objectives, and the measures alike. Thereby one finds labour-market policy measures that
could be executed and controlled by the PES and also brought along remarkable results for
women16 (see Implementation Report 2000). The following statement sums up the
consideration of women’s interests (in NAP 1998 and NAP 1999) and pinpoints the
shortcomings with precision:

"While the greater integration of women into labour force is expressed as explicit objective in
the NAP and shall be reached by a larger consideration of women in skill training measures
(improving employability pillar I and IV) or by promoting the extension of childcare facilities
(pillar IV), binding and reliable measures for the improvement of working conditions are
missing. The gender perspective is hardly considered in the measures for developing
trepreneurship (pillar II) and is especially not taken into account for the policies essential
for women in order to encourage adaptability of employers and employees (pillar III)."
(Leitner/Wroblewski 2000:95)

What novelties does the current NAP contain? An analysis of the NAP 2000 is difficult
because several papers are overlapping and referring to each other. Thus for Austria after the
NAP 1998 (50 pages; April 1998) there is the NAP 1999 (65 pages; May 1999), the
Implementation Report 1999 (41 pages; June 1999), and finally – in joint form – the
longer is a single paper standing on its own but consists of the continuation of the measures of
the NAP 1999 (to be read in the paper NAP 1999, partly also in a further developed form
formulated in the Implementation Report 2000) as well as the "new initiatives of the NAP
2000", which as part II in the present report comprise only 5 pages anymore. This new part of
the NAP 2000 – unlike in previous years– consists of the chapter II.1 "Initiatives in response
to the Council recommendations for Austria" and chapter II.2 "New measures for
implementing the guidelines 2000 and new policy". In the latter part II.2 the structure of the
guidelines is followed in brief sentences and a cross-reference to chapter II.1 is made. The
whole matter is complicated by the fact that the numbering of the guidelines is being changed

16 Many objectives of the labour market policies for women were fulfilled or even exceeded their scheduled
targets. The quality of the individual measures cannot be further dealt with here.
from NAP to NAP but also from NAP to Implementation Report (!)\textsuperscript{17}. Such a structure then is only accessible to experts, and for an analysis with an across-section focus like the gender aspect it is very difficult to be used.

This task is somewhat facilitated because in part II.1 one of the three central positions is dedicated to the problem of gender gap (II.1.2. Recommendation on narrowing the gender gap). Because of its brevity – and in order to avoid another cross-reference – the chapter is rendered fully below in (see Box 1).

**Box 1:** NAP 2000, Part II, Chapter II.1.2. Recommendation on Narrowing the Gender Gap

### II.1.2. Recommendation on narrowing the gender gap

The "Joint Employment Report 1999" adopted by the European Council and the European Commission refers to gender gaps that exist in Austria in some areas and specifically to the significant gender gap in employment of 21 percentage points. The second Council recommendation thus reads: Austria should pursue a comprehensive strategy to narrow the gender gap in employment, 

inter alia by putting in place measures which facilitate the reconciliation of work and family life.

In its 1999 NAP Austria has already defined the following targets:

− Unemployment among women is to be reduced and/or lowered down to that of men (the general objective for 2002 of getting close to 3.5% applies to both women and men)
− Labour force participation of women is to be increased and/or approximated to that of men.

A number of measures were taken to achieve these objectives. Most of these measures could be implemented or addressed in 1999 (see implementation of pillar IV).

In response to the Council recommendation, Austria takes the following additional measures to reduce the gender gap in the labour market:

1. **Raise the female employment rate and reduce female unemployment with a special focus on the reconciliation of work and family life for both women and men:**
   - Provide specific services, information and counselling in every regional AMS [PES] office for women returners also during maternity leave/inactivity no matter whether these women qualify for benefits
   - Offer special education and training programmes (AMS [PES] or other operators) for women on educational leave (especially when this follows on maternity leave)
   - Measures for lone parents (inter alia, higher earnings disregard under new childcare regulations for lone parents)
   - Part-time work and part-time parental leave benefits: improve the legal framework to encourage take-up of part-time work and part-time parental leave by women and men
   - Encourage a corporate philosophy and culture (e.g. by subsidy programmes) in which childcare and paternity leave form an integral part
   - Step up motivation-oriented measures such as "deeds, not words" (Taten statt Worte), an award given to the most family- and women-friendly companies
   - Continue expansion of childcare facilities, especially for small children (concerted action by laender and federal authorities), while keeping an eye on nation-wide quality standards
   - Tailor childcare options to the special needs of jobless and/or job-seeking women in any given region
   - Prepare amendment to the Equal Treatment Act (Gleichbehandlungsgesetz) to improve its effectiveness

2. **Reduce labour market segregation and improve women's level of educational attainment:**
   - Introduce specific measures targeted on (young) women in all areas of education; exploit all co-funding options with federal authorities, laender and the European Union to foster rural regions in particular
   - Expand counselling centres for young women and projects advocating non-traditional, proactive occupations (such as the springboard [Sprungbrett] initiative
   - Foster in-house gender equality programmes

\textsuperscript{17} Thus in the Implementation Report 2000 the guideline 15 has disappeared and there are only 21 instead of 22 guidelines listed.
Managing E-Quality: train executives for gender equality oriented management (especially with regard to reconciling work and family life)
- Subsidise employers who take specific measures suited to promote equal treatment
- Step up targeted apprenticeship subsidy programmes to reduce gender-specific segregation
- Enhance outreach to employers to ensure employment/retention of women following completed apprenticeships, especially in non-traditional segments

3. **Reduce pay gap:**
- Offer counselling to employers to promote in-house skills training of women and gender equality within companies (e.g.: project of the office for training and employment development in Graz [Büro für Ausbildungs- and Beschäftigungsentwicklung]). Create corresponding services in all laender.
- Launch information campaign on the issue of pay gaps between women and men (awareness campaign) targeted on 1) the general public, 2) the social partners, 3) women (women tend to sell themselves cheaper or are too modest when entering or re-entering the labour market)

4. **Upgrade gender mainstreaming and/or create suitable structures:**
- Establish special co-ordination offices for equal opportunities and gender issues in every ministry

*Source: Austrian NAP 2000:29f*

How can these measures be differentiated according to a proactive or defensive gender mainstreaming approach? The measures under point 1 "Encourage a corporate philosophy and culture (e.g. by subsidy programmes) in which childcare and paternity leave form an integral part" or "Tailor childcare options to the special needs of jobless and/or job-seeking women in any given region" could be rather added to a proactive approach. In comparison, an assessment as defensive approach has to be made when the reconcilement of work and family for working parents (who in most cases are mothers) is enabled via part-time work. On the other hand part-time work is an example for the difficulty of assessing gender equality because in most cases reduced working time – under given framework conditions – still means the end of a professional career. Although the individual woman might be satisfied with this solution for the short-term, the influence on gender equality structures on the labour market – because of consequences on segregation and wage gap – is even negative. An interesting indicator would be the number of women who without the option of part-time would leave the gainful working world entirely. This example can be used to demonstrate that the assessment of gender equality bursts the boundaries of the labour market system. But this is a circumstance which is scarcely considered in the NAP.

Besides, how should a measure like in point 4 "Establish special co-ordination offices for equal opportunities and gender issues in every ministry" be assessed when the position of the Minister of Women’s Affairs has just been abolished and so far the new government has not undertaken any actions whatsoever in that direction?

Little can be said indeed about the extent, the effectiveness, and the direction of the listed measures because of the short formulations and the rather general character of the statements as well as in the face of the changed political conditions.18

---

18 Because of this an attempt to categorize according to proactive and defensive measures was terminated.
All in all the listed measures appear to be not particularly promising in succeeding to reduce the gender gap in total – even though many of them (under optimistic assumptions) could be assessed as "proactive". There is too much emphasis on motivational measures, on counselling, information campaigns, and voluntariness. Counselling or information campaigns on their own surely won’t do away with the gender pay gap. The measures for reducing the segregation also don’t seem to go beyond individual selective programmes with low widespread impact.

In addition, most of the measures are direct women-specific measures and not mainstreaming measures in the sense of an integration of the gender aspect in all processes and areas of (employment)policy (like prescribed in the definition taken over in the NAP). Measures for women are therefore still and again viewed as an "additional programme" for a disadvantaged group on the labour market.

Although the approach of specific positive action measures should further be pursued in a twin track approach to gender equality (see Rubery 1999), there is the danger that the promotion measures are only realized selectively (like drops of water on a hot stone), and structural interrelations that create the discrimination against women remain untouched. That this danger is very well given in Austria can be deducted from the fact that in the new part of the NAP 2000 in the chapters "Recommendation on the participation of older workers in employment" and "Recommendation on reducing the tax burden on labour" women are not mentioned with a single word (!).

2.3. Coherence and consistency in the gender mainstreaming approach

As already mentioned the paper is (not only) inconsistent in the gender mainstreaming approach. If the concept as such is already only applied in a differing extent, then in addition the contents themselves are not at all tuned to each other.

There are plenty of target conflicts between increasing the employment of women with policies to strengthen equal opportunities. Basically – and this is also addressed by the WIFO and IHS evaluation – the qualitative aspect of employment is neglected (for example the securing of stable employment careers and income that enables to make a living). This mainly applies to the extension of part-time work, which definitely affects women.

Via an extension of employment and qualification measures labour market segregation is only marginally touched, on the contrary, women are to be found increasingly rarely in men’s professions (see the interesting explanations in Leitner/Wroblewski 2000). Even if horizontal

---

19 This is also true for pillars 1 to 3 in chapter II.2 "New measures for implementing the guidelines 2000 and new policy initiatives" (see Box A5). Apart from one exception (GL6: training measures for women within adult education programmes, especially technology training) women are not explicitly referred to.
segregation is very difficult to dissolve, effective policy is needed to dismantle them and to prevent their negative consequences\textsuperscript{20}. Especially typical women’s professions, in which 58% of all women work, do have unattractive employment conditions (ibidem).

Above all there is one principle problem which blocks a consistent mainstreaming policy in Austria: Traditional division of labour, according to which women have the sole responsibility for care duties, still is dominant. Women can/shall very well pursue some gainful working activity, but their first priority should however always be family work.

"While in other European countries the increasing of women’s employment is an undisputed objective, political targets, measures and legal regulations in Austria up to now stood under the preconditions of family policy considerations. Thereby the extension is no purely emancipatory objective but results from economic considerations to promote economic growth and to save expensive interruptions of gainful employment." (Leitner/Wroblewski 2000:96)

The new government wants to change this course somehow by again prolonging the period of time for parental leave\textsuperscript{21}— after it was reduced on budgetary grounds only a few years ago.

In the NAP 2000 it is repeatedly stated that also men should be increasingly motivated for family work. This statement, however, is not connected to any effective and concrete measures (this also held true for the old government). As already argued above gender aspects - especially for measures regarding the work organization - are missing entirely. Flexibilization in Austrian enterprises by and large already enforce the incompatibility of work and leisure/family – for women as well as for men.

2.4. Mechanisms for implementing gender mainstreaming\textsuperscript{22}

It was explained above that the proceeding for the implementation of the NAP 1998/1999 was granted high priority.

"For a successful realization of the planning of measures of the NAP, the accompanying observation, evaluation and intervention in combination with suitable measures of the public work is indispensable. The Federal government has therefore commissioned a steering committee, consisting of employees of the Federal Ministry of Labour, Health and Social Affairs and of the Federal Ministry for Economic Affairs, to assign the individual implementation measures to those respectively responsible (ministries, social partners, federal provinces, municipalities), to draw up a schedule for reports and implementation plans, to reappraise the respective status of the implementation for the ministries as well as to ensure communication on the status of implementation and the implementation requisites."

(Implementation Report for 1999:7)

\textsuperscript{20} In the presidency conclusions of Lisbon is also stressed as one of four key areas “furthering all aspects of equal opportunities, including reducing occupational segregation, and making it easier to reconcile working life and family life, in particular by setting a new benchmark for improved childcare provision”.

\textsuperscript{21} In addition, parental leave benefit is supposed to lose its quality of an insurance benefit and shall be drawn independently of the employment situation. Thereby critics sense the danger that in the future parental leave benefits will not be grounded as strongly as up to now and will be more prone to potential saving plans.

\textsuperscript{22} At this point I want to thank kindly Nadja Bergmann, co-ordinator of the NAP, for a very interesting interview as well as for a lot of material.
Mainstreaming is not mentioned at this point. Interesting passages on the realization of mainstreaming can however be found under GL 18 in the NAP 1999 (see Box A2 in the annex) and under GL 19 (both "Adopting a gender mainstreaming approach") in the Implementation Report for 2000:

"To achieve sustainable gender-mainstreaming and equal opportunities in all areas of the employment strategy, we need the willingness of policy-makers and social partners and a longer-term concept. The measures described in the NAP 1999 for appointing and training gender experts and implementing suitable structures designed to accompany and translate the process of gender mainstreaming are currently being built up but still require broader implementation." (p.22, see Box A4)

The latter statement can only fully be agreed with.

Up to now a whole series of equal opportunities units (above all the ones of the former Federal Ministry of Labour, Health and Social Affairs [FMLHS] and of the Office of the Minister for Women’s Affairs) were involved in the process of the NAP-emergence. The main emphasis of their work mainly constituted the women-specific measures of pillar 4. In addition, a gender mainstreaming representative was appointed (a representative of the equal opportunities units of the former FMLHS), who also participated in the preparation meetings for pillar 1 to 3. Despite this structure the influence remained inconsistent and fragmentary. Although a series of - more or less – successful specific measures for women – especially in the labour market policy – was installed, no comprehensive mainstreaming was achieved.

In the former FMLHS an inter-departmental working group on gender mainstreaming was established. A highly promising process was thereby now – shortly after its beginnings – stopped with the new government, among other reasons because the previous division of departments (as described in the introduction to this report) was changed.

In this working group on gender mainstreaming the women (men were hardly represented) began to discuss the possible concrete implementation of the mainstreaming concept. A main discussion point was how gender mainstreaming could be brought closer to the social partners. A result of these considerations was a letter, which was sent out in the most recent NAP-process and which can be viewed as guideline for mainstreaming (see chapter 4 and Box A6). Furthermore there was the idea to carry out a high level conference for the top representatives of the social partners to inform about and discuss the potential realization of the concept. This is not a current plan any more.

---

23 When the commentaries of the social partners were made, equal opportunity units also were involved on the part of the Chamber of Labour and the Trade Union.
3. Assessing the priority accorded to gender equality

EU employment policy has led to the fact that in Austria the addressing of equal opportunities issues and mainstreaming is – unlike before – not smiled at any more in large parts of the administration and politics but taken seriously; this can already be regarded as a great progress. To what extent, however, the topic is ascribed priority is not unified. Women’s interests still are scarcely established on an institutional level. This is on the one hand connected to the circumstance that there is far too little public gender knowledge and awareness (and also no desire for it) and on the other hand to the fact that top-level decision makers (in most cases men) – apart from a few exceptions – don’t see to the topic. When mainstreaming is not prescribed as a concept from above, then its consideration depends on the respective personal attitudes of the people responsible on the lower levels. An additional factor is whether equal opportunities units are involved in the making of the NAP or intervene offensively in the process.

As a consequence a NAP like the Austrian one now emerges, a paper inhomogeneous with regard to gender aspects. Some parts of it depict a reality. Others have to be mostly counted to the category of wishful thinking and will never be put into practice because there is no broad political willingness to back it up.

In evaluating the evidence as to whether there are signs of increasing, decreasing or similar levels of priority attached to gender mainstreaming in the course of the three National Action Plans (1998, 1999 and 2000), the division lines cannot be drawn according to topical fields/guidelines because the extent of priority accorded to gender equality is more dependent on the operating institutions or the programmes.

As an example for the successful implementation of the gender-mainstreaming approach the Austrian Public Employment Service [PES] is named first in the Implementation Report 2000 (see Box A4). In the Labour Market Policy carried out by the PES the gender aspect has indeed attained great importance in recent years, a development, which in the course of time shows in those guidelines (especially 1-3, 19-21) for which the PES is in charge. A decisive prerequisite for this positive development is to be found in the organization culture. Women constitute a majority among the employees (although also here they are underrepresented in the highest positions) and a productive equal opportunity unit has prepared the ground for internal measures for the long term – the organization has a very interesting internal positive action plan - as well as for external measures.

Also within the European Social Fund (ESF) a positive development is becoming apparent in recent years. After an evaluation of how Austria implemented the equal opportunities objective of the European Social Fund was published and an international conference on this issue was held (see BMAGS 1999), gender mainstreaming has now become a horizontal
objective which is supplemented by a special women-specific priority area. Under one of three "Horizontal Issues" "The ESF's contribution to implementing the NAP" is described in the Implementation Report 2000 among other things as follows:

"Exact data on 1999 participants are only available for the first half. They show that the proportion of women could be clearly raised: it totalled 48% or 47,000 female participants. Just as in the years before, women were more involved in programmes targeted on the unemployed than in those targeted on the employed. Nevertheless female participation in objective 4 programmes reached 38%. The gender mainstreaming approach becomes quite obvious when we consider that only a comparatively small number of 9,500 women was supported within objective 3 programmes promoting equal opportunities, whereas the great majority of women was supported in other areas." (Implementation Report 2000:27)

A certain understanding of mainstreaming can be read from the last sentence, namely that horizontal integration is given priority to specific promotion measures for women. In the Implementation Report 1999 mainstreaming itself was still one of the horizontal issues (see Box A3), which possibly marks the development of the mainstreaming concept.

In some parts there also were positive developments in the area of the former Federal Ministry of Education and Cultural Affairs and of the former Federal Ministry of Science and Research, which are also listed as positive examples in the Implementation Report 200024 (see Box A4). However, the approach here has the tendency of rather corresponding to "traditional" women's promotions concepts, as for example becomes clear in the White Book for the promotion of women in the sciences — a very positive initiative.

In pillar 4 "Strengthening Equal Opportunities Policies for Women and Men" in the NAP 1999 the main emphasis lay on the one hand in active labour market policy measures (in particular a qualifying offensive), on the other hand in a further extension of childcare facilities. Individual interesting measures are the flexibilization of parental leave25, women foundations, a plant-level promotion of equal opportunities issued by the Federal Minister for Women's Affairs26, the women returners programme by the PES, an amendment to the Federal Equal Treatment Act (Bundesgleichbehandlungsgesetz), and measures issued in the framework of the new established territorial employment pacts (TEP) (for details see Implementation Report 2000:22ff). Besides, the measures added in 2000, which were already mentioned above, don't bring out any new real features.

In the accompanying evaluation (see Leitner/Wroblewski 2000) it shows that training measures for women could be strongly increased, a detailed analysis, however, indicates some shortcomings in terms of quality. Thus, women are underrepresented in intensive qualification

24 Although especially the measures for the educational system in the NAP lack concrete figures so that possible consequences cannot be estimated as to their extent.
25 with the possibility of the utilisation of parental leave time up to the 7th year of the child in several blocks, flexibilising of the terms for registration and entitling fathers to parental leave in their own right.
26 An initiative that had more symbolic value than practical effects and which can hardly be pursued under the new government.
measures, and when being selecting for training measures those women are discriminated against who are in need of promotion most urgently. In addition, it cannot be controlled yet, whether the training leads to stable employment. In terms of extension and improvement of childcare facilities it is demonstrated that currently an additional need for 139,500 childcare places for children between 0 and 14 years exists in Austria. Therefore it can be inferred that the enforced promotion of the NAP in fact proves as going into the right direction – 19,000 new childcare places were established in 1998, 10,200 places were established in 1999, but this can only make up for a small part of the deficit.

As was pointed out before women are showing rising employment numbers in recent years and even falling unemployment numbers in 1999. This positive trend can to a great extent be led back to the upward economic trend and hence less to the NAP. But still – as the verifiable labour market policy targets of the PES indicate – many women have profited from the NAP measures, in particular from the ones for juveniles, long-term unemployed persons and mothers with care responsibilities. The following statement, which could not be made until recently because of technical reasons with regard to the data, is particularly satisfactory: An analysis of the gender-specific distribution of active labour market spending shows that 50.2% of the funds used for active labour market measures were for women.

4. Priority areas for future action and identification of best practice

In the explanations so far it became clear that because of the disuniform and unsystematic consideration of the gender aspect in the Austrian NAPs it is only possibly with great difficulty to give a unified and systematic assessment of the implementation of mainstreaming.

If one considers that in Austria the word "mainstreaming" was completely unknown in 1997/1998, then we can talk about a triumphal march of the term – nowadays politicians of all directions use this concept. But very often entirely different things are meant with it. The lack of a uniform definition leads to a great popularity of the term, which is to be seen as a central disadvantage. Thus with the reference to mainstreaming each and every women’s promotion measure can be carried out - or not carried out. In most cases previous policies are further pursued and only renamed in "mainstreaming". The experts dealing with the NAP co-ordination have gained the following experience: In political practice it is in any case considerably easier achievable to install women- and/or family-specific additional measures than having to change traditional (male dominated) structures and processes through an integrative understanding of mainstreaming.

Furthermore it thus follows that an understanding of mainstreaming has to be brought closer to decision-makers in top positions reinforcedly. It has to be made "Chief’s Matter" and
should no longer depend on the coincidence of individual attitudes. The recommendations of
the Commission can have a great influence on this circumstance. Besides, the Commission
would have the possibility to work out existing papers on mainstreaming to be fit for practice
especially geared to the NAP-process, which could be made available to the people in charge
on the lower levels\textsuperscript{27}. For there still are great insecurities with regard to definition and
implementation of mainstreaming\textsuperscript{28}.

As argued before the consideration of mainstreaming is heavily dependent on administrating
institutions. As a central conclusion it can therefore be recorded: \textit{If gender aspects are no
issue within the organization and no women-friendly personnel policy is pursued\textsuperscript{29}, then
mainstreaming is hardly – or only very unsystematically – realized in the policy or in
measures directed outwards.}\textsuperscript{30}

After the analysis of the papers one quite pragmatic suggestion is imposing itself. By now the
Austrian National Action Plan is only comprehensible for insiders. In particular, the NAP
2000 is no paper standing on its own any more, an overview can no longer be kept in terms of
its cross-references, and the numbering of the GL has often been changed. An improvement
should be made to that effect. The complex procedure could be followed by a concluding
phase in which a co-ordination of the forms of representation and a harmonization of the
different approaches are effected to increase the consistency of the paper. Also the basic and
additional information (papers of the Commission, evaluations, reports and so on) have
attained a complexity\textsuperscript{31}, which are by now very hard to grasp. Besides, the NAP-emergence
process – probably not only in Austria\textsuperscript{32} – was marked by a great pressure of time, which
doesn’t exactly enhance quality.

While the contents of the NAP receive a lot of attention, in my opinion there is not enough
attention directed to the procedure and the contextual factors.

In the area of equal opportunity policies informal communication and structures - mostly
among women - play a major role. This can very well have advantages but a certain
formalization, which also involves men and above all influential decision-makers, should be

\textsuperscript{27} Long theoretical reports are not very useful for political and administrative practice. A good example for such
material is "A guide to gender impact assessment".

\textsuperscript{28} To improve this situation a (recently finished) study was financed by the PES, see Naylon, I./Weber, F. 2000.

\textsuperscript{29} How does this actually look like within the European Commission?

\textsuperscript{30} The Austrian Federal Equal Treatment Act (Bundesgleichbehandlungsgesetz) with its obligation to active
women’s promotion is therefore of great importance.

\textsuperscript{31} The new technology (internet, homepage, email) does have enormous advantages in this area but also
contributes to acceleration and at times inefficiency.

\textsuperscript{32} The schedules, which are partly laid down by the Commission, are far too tight. Thus, this paper had to be
produced within 20 days (!). It would be interesting to pursue the question how many people all over Europe
had to put in very long working hours and weekend work because of the NAP-process and its evaluation. This
is a form of flexibilization that surely impedes a reconcilement of work and private life/family.
promoted\textsuperscript{33}. Thus, inter-institutional working groups on Gender Mainstreaming at national level could be stimulated by the European Commission – like they were initiated in Austria (see Best Practise I) – in an extended and formalized form.

**Box 2:** **BEST PRACTISE I, Establishment of an Inter-departmental Working Group on Gender Mainstreaming in the former Austrian Federal Ministry of Labour, Health and Social Affairs**

In the former Austrian Federal Ministry of Labour, Health and Social Affairs an inter-departmental working group on gender mainstreaming was established. The members of this working group started to discuss the possible concrete implementation of the mainstreaming concept in their surroundings and with regard to the realization of the NAP. One of the key issues was the question how gender mainstreaming could be brought closer to the social partners, as in here there is a particularly great deficit. These considerations resulted in a letter, which was sent out together with an invitation to make statements on the NAP 2000. This letter can be seen as a kind of guideline for mainstreaming (see Box A6). In addition, there were discussions about carrying out a high level conference (invited by the two former Ministers for Social Affairs and Economics) for the tops of the social partners to inform about and discuss the potential realization of the concept. Because of the new political conditions this is not a current plan anymore.

Next to the procedure the evaluation of policies is of utmost importance. The most beautiful policy is of little value if it is not measured as to its actual results. Here Austria has already set interesting initiatives by commissioning comprehensive accompanying evaluations in 1998/1999 (see Chapter 2.1). One main focus of the reports concerned the subject area of equal opportunities and mainstreaming, what is selected as "Best Practise II":

**Box 3:** **BEST PRACTISE II, Accompanying Evaluation of the Austrian NAP on Equal Opportunities und Mainstreaming**

In 1998 several Austrian research institutes were commissioned by the former Austrian Federal Ministry of Labour, Health and Social Affairs and the former Federal Ministry for Economic Affairs to observe and assess the implementation of the NAP with regard to its effects. All in all 10 central points were selected according to which the evaluation was structured. One of them was equal opportunities and mainstreaming\textsuperscript{34}. Thereby there already are – apart from fundamental statements about the gainful employment of women and the consideration of the gender aspect in the Austrian NAPs - differentiated data and analyses available for Austria. Success and shortcomings can be identified and could flow into the structuring of the new NAP.

So far, however, it us unclear what influence the results are going to have on the future NAP-structuring. Therefore it would be necessary to install binding feed back loops not only on the lower but also on the highest levels of political decision-making. The evaluations on a national level could very well complete the evaluations on a European level. Although

\textsuperscript{33} Thus it should be normal for men to address gender aspects in front of a male audience, a sight which up to now could be witnessed extremely rarely. Awareness about gender aspects should be one criterion when filling the positions of decision-makers.

\textsuperscript{34} A summary of the evaluation can be found in Leitner/Wroblewski 2000. In this paper the report was quoted in various contexts.
qualitative evaluation criteria would have to be included more strongly. Also the procedure for the emergence of the NAP could be evaluated; this would be particularly interesting in terms of mainstreaming.

In conclusion it remains to be said that there is no doubt about the fact that European employment and equal opportunity policy\textsuperscript{35} has enriched Austrian employment policy for women, if not to say established it in its present form. Especially recently women have profited greatly from the development on the labour market. The increase of the wage gap in recent years, \textit{although there have been equal opportunity measures and although the educational level of women has risen}, is however alarming and shows that efforts have to be enforced and new roads have to be taken urgently. The policy of women-specific additional programmes until now already is a progress compared to before but cannot break up discriminating structures. More than ever before Austrian women would need a continuous policy which understands women as individuals with an entitlement to securing a living of one’s own and not as a part of the family – in lifelong economic dependency of a breadwinner. Because of the new political situation the future for women and equal opportunity policy in Austria is, however, at present very uncertain. Thus it will be even more important for progressive national forces within Austria of being able to refer to a women’s promoting and progressive European policy. The possibility of this kind of support is not to be underestimated.

\textsuperscript{35} A summary of progress and recent trends in this field is to find in EC 2000.
References

BMAGS [FMLHS] (Bundesministerium für Arbeit, Gesundheit und Soziales) [Federal Ministry of Labour, Health and Social Affairs], Bericht über die soziale Lage 1998, Vienna, 2000

BMAGS [FMLHS] (Bundesministerium für Arbeit, und Soziales) [Federal Ministry of Labour, Health and Social Affairs], Europa und alles wird gut? Tagungsdokumentation, Vienna, 1999

BMAGS [FMLHS] (Bundesministerium für Arbeit, und Soziales) [Federal Ministry of Labour, Health and Social Affairs], Die arbeitsmarktpolitischen Zielvorgaben gemäß § 59 Abs. 2 Arbeitsmarktservicegesetz (AMSG), internes Papier, Vienna, 1998


EC (European Commission), A guide to gender impact assessment, Luxembourg

EC (European Commission), Report from the Commission to the Council, the European Parliament, the Economic and Social Committee and the Committee of the Regions, Equal Opportunities for Women and Men in the European Union 1999, Brussels, March 2000

EC, (European Commission), Leitlinien für beschäftigungspolitische Maßnahmen der Mitgliedstaaten im Jahr 2000 & Empfehlung des Rates zur Durchführung der Beschäftigungspolitik der Mitgliedstaaten, Brussels, 2000

EC, (European Commission), Presidency Conclusions, Lisbon European Council, March 2000


Leitner, A./Wroblewski, A., Chancengleichheit und Gender Mainstreaming – Ergebnisse der begleitenden Evaluierung des österreichischen NAP [Equal opportunities for women and men and gender mainstreaming – Results of the accompanying evaluation of the Austrian NAP], Sociological Series No. 41, equihs, Institute for Advanced Studies, Vienna, April 2000


Rubery, J., Gender mainstreaming in European Employment Policy, a Report by the European Commission's Group of Experts on Gender and Employment, Manchester School of Management, UMIST, March 1999

WIFO/IHS, Begleitende Bewertung der Umsetzung des Nationalen Aktionsplanes für Beschäftigung im Jahr 1999 [accompanying assessment of the implementation of the NAP in 1999]; different reports, Vienna, one in August 1999, another with the same title in February 2000.

WIFO/IHS, Expertise zum nationalen Aktionsplan für Beschäftigung in Österreich, Vienna, November 1998
Annex

Table 2: Employees by Sex 1990 – 1999

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>Men</th>
<th>Women</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>Men</th>
<th>Women</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1990</td>
<td>2,929</td>
<td>1,719</td>
<td>1,210</td>
<td>2.3%</td>
<td>2.2%</td>
<td>2.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1991</td>
<td>2,997</td>
<td>1,752</td>
<td>1,245</td>
<td>2.3%</td>
<td>1.9%</td>
<td>2.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1992</td>
<td>3,056</td>
<td>1,767</td>
<td>1,289</td>
<td>2.0%</td>
<td>0.8%</td>
<td>3.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1993</td>
<td>3,055</td>
<td>1,756</td>
<td>1,299</td>
<td>0.0%</td>
<td>-0.6%</td>
<td>0.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1994</td>
<td>3,071</td>
<td>1,762</td>
<td>1,309</td>
<td>0.5%</td>
<td>0.3%</td>
<td>0.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1995</td>
<td>3,068</td>
<td>1,757</td>
<td>1,311</td>
<td>-0.1%</td>
<td>-0.2%</td>
<td>0.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1996</td>
<td>3,047</td>
<td>1,739</td>
<td>1,308</td>
<td>-0.7%</td>
<td>-1.1%</td>
<td>-0.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1997</td>
<td>3,056</td>
<td>1,740</td>
<td>1,316</td>
<td>0.3%</td>
<td>0.0%</td>
<td>0.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1998</td>
<td>3,077</td>
<td>1,744</td>
<td>1,332</td>
<td>0.7%</td>
<td>0.3%</td>
<td>1.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1999</td>
<td>3,108</td>
<td>1,755</td>
<td>1,353</td>
<td>1.0%</td>
<td>0.5%</td>
<td>1.6%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Change 1990 to 1999 | 5.1% | 1.5% | 10.1% |
| Absolute | 148 | 25 | 122 |

Source: BMAGS 2000; national data by the Federation of Austrian Social Insurance Agencies

Figure 1: Unemployment by Sex 1987 - 1999

Source: BMAGS 2000, national data, registered unemployment by the Public Employment Service [PES]
Figure 2: The Mean Net Income of Employees in 1997

NET-INCOME 1997 IN ATS PER MONTH

Source: BMAGS 2000; Data from Income Tax Statistics

Men earn 47% more than women!

Figure 3: Gender-Specific Unemployment Rates According to Education* and Age Groups

UNEMPLOYMENT RATES BY SEX 1999

Source: AMS [PES], *data for 1997
### Box A1: Examples of Policies Consistent with Proactive Gender Mainstreaming.
- In Austrian NAP 2000 Considered?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Policies consistent with proactive gender mainstreaming</th>
<th>Considered in the Austrian NAP 2000</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Pillar 1: Employability policies consistent with proactive gender mainstreaming</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The adoption of an employment as well as an unemployment target in quantitative labour market objectives and the disaggregation and monitoring of targets by gender</td>
<td>Yes, there are quantitative labour market objectives by gender (unemployment rate)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The use of active labour market policies, training programmes in new skill areas and lifelong learning programmes to challenge gender segregation</td>
<td>Only to a little extent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The modernisation of social welfare programmes to facilitate not only a move from a passive to an active society, but also to make the benefit system more compatible with dual earner and single parent households.</td>
<td>Not at all</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The development of a multi-layered approach to discrimination and disadvantage where the specific problems of gender are recognised and acted upon separately, but the interactions with other types of disadvantage, for example by ethnic groups are also identified.</td>
<td>Only in exceptions (for example youth unemployment) but not for the groups of the elderly, ethnic minorities or migrants</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Pillar 2: Entrepreneurship policies consistent with proactive gender mainstreaming</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The development of targeted programmes designed to overcome the barriers to entrepreneurship faced by women in financial markets, product markets and in reconciling entrepreneurship and family life.</td>
<td>Only in individual measures</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The taking of steps to regularise the status of disguised dependent employment such as homeworking in the self employed sector</td>
<td>Only mentioned in the care sector (for example care-givers, GL 12)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The promotion of the social economy on the basis of providing high quality and high levels of care services and high quality job opportunities</td>
<td>Not systematically, although quality is mentioned in the area of childcare</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The development of new job opportunities based around the principle of promoting gender desegregation in the workplace</td>
<td>Not mentioned</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The restructuring of tax to boost demand for social and personal services without jeopardising existing levels of social expenditure and social protection</td>
<td>Gender aspect not considered</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The development of policies to reduce underutilisation of skills and potential in the labour force in contrast to policies aimed at maximising the share of low skilled and low income jobs in the economy.</td>
<td>With the extension of part-time the second variant is indirectly enforced</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Pillar 3: Adaptability policies consistent with proactive gender mainstreaming</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The reorganisation of work and working time linked to reduction in gender segregation and to positive flexible working, involving higher skill levels and greater autonomy</td>
<td>Gender aspect not mentioned at all</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The use of changes to working time change to promote a rethinking of the interface between work and employment for men and women, and involving greater attention being paid to employees need for social and private life and to the need to co-ordinate work life and city life</td>
<td>There are no similar considerations in the NAP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The development of policies which provide an equal or greater emphasis on individual rights to move from part-time to full-time work to rights to move from full-time to part-time</td>
<td>Considered – but only in the public service sector</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The creation of positive incentives for employers to invest in the training and certification of skills in flexible, part-time and/or low skilled job areas</td>
<td>Scarcely (only indirectly via the ESF programme)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The development of social plans or redeployment policies for those employed in service as well as in manufacturing and heavy industry sectors.</td>
<td>If mentioned (measures for the elderly) then without gender aspect</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Pillar 4: Equal opportunities policies consistent with proactive gender mainstreaming</strong></td>
<td><strong>More in words than in acts – actual positive development in some fields/institutions (PES, ESF)</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The implementation of gender mainstreaming, conceived as a long term objective likely to lead to changes in the structure and organisation of society</td>
<td>Mentioned but not creditable after the abolition of the Office of the Minister of Women's Affairs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The adoption of a twin track approach to gender equality, involving both mainstreaming and specific equality policies</td>
<td>Targets are much more quantity than quality driven; there are important (but still too little) measures in the extension of childcare institutions; traditional values are not touched</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The promotion of improvements in both the quantity and quality of women’s employment and involving policies to reduce the underemployment of women as well as the removal of barriers to access to employment</td>
<td>No actions on general trends (there is just one study going on at present); lot of problems with income statistics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The development of measures to reduce the gender pay gap, involving evaluation and action on general trends in pay policy as well as active monitoring and development of statistical indicators at the workplace and the labour market level.</td>
<td>More words than acts, no effective measures to include men; quality standards are mentioned for care services</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The design of family friendly policies to promote continuity of employment, more equal participation by men in family responsibilities and high quality standards in care services.</td>
<td>There are some measures for returners (also during maternity leave/inactivity, no matter whether these women qualify for benefits)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The development of opportunities for the inactive as well as the unemployed to reintegrate into the labour market.</td>
<td>Source: Examples given by the work programme for this report established by the UMIST group (see also Rubery 1999)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Box A2: NAP 1999, GL 19 – Adopting a Gender-Mainstreaming Approach

GL 19 – Adopting a gender-mainstreaming approach

Current situation
Although their labour market position is rather positive when compared with that of other European countries, Austrian women are more often affected by unemployment, are disadvantaged when accessing the labour market and/or certain occupations and sectors, have poorer career prospects, earn significantly less than men and are discriminated when trying to reconcile work and family life. To eliminate those discriminatory patterns, which occur in the most different areas, a comprehensive approach is needed. Gender mainstreaming is part of such an approach, positive action the other.

In accordance with the definition adopted by the Council of Europe in 1998, gender mainstreaming in the National Action Plan is considered to be ‘(re)organisation, improvement, development and evaluation of policy processes, so that a gender equality perspective is incorporated in all policies at all levels and at all stages, by the actors normally involved in policy-making.’

Essential for the success of a gender mainstreaming strategy is the will of all policy-makers to implement the strategy.

National targets – indicators – budgetary implications:
In the present NAP, gender mainstreaming informs all guidelines in terms of a comprehensive approach. This is why all policy actors – be it government representatives or social partners – have pursued the following objectives in drawing up a gender-mainstreaming policy:

- to enhance awareness of the differing situations of women and men
- to consider the differing gender-specific effects of the targets and measures formulated by them and, in so doing,
- to pursue the objective of equality for women.

An indicator for assessing the effectiveness of this approach will thus be the reduction in the gender inequalities referred to above. This requires a systematic collection of all relevant data: structure of workers by qualifications, industries, hierarchical gradations, wages, bonuses, skills training, in-house further training, incomes, working hours, staffing of policy and other decision-making bodies, and the distribution of unpaid work between women and men.

Since the disadvantaging of women in society is also expressed in the language we use, it has been our aim to word the National Action Plan in gender-neutral terms. In future, there will be an even greater focus on linguistic equal treatment of women in drafting bills and official publications.

Planned measures:
Basically, the gender-mainstreaming approach is to be adopted for all guidelines of the National Action Plan. To illustrate this, here are two examples taken from pillars I and II.

- GL 3: Target: use of budgetary funds to foster equality of opportunities for women at least in proportion to their share of unemployment
- GL 11: Existing business start-up counselling should be made more attractive for women

In addition, the federal government and the social partners will take the following measures:

- Efforts are to be made to give women the same opportunities to fill higher-echelon jobs. For this purpose such options as quotas, positive action, mentoring projects, etc. are available.
- Greater mainstreaming awareness among policy-makers (e.g. by taking recourse to external gender experts and introducing internal structures to accompany and implement the process):
  * Creation and extension of suitable, unbureaucratic structures designed to accompany and implement the process of gender mainstreaming
  * Courses, workshops, training, conferences enabling international comparisons of best-practice models of gender mainstreaming
  * Evaluation of the gender-specific impact of all measures based on appropriate data collection and processing, plus reports by all ministries and involved institutions (social partners, AMS [PES], etc.) within the framework of the equal opportunities report
- Public funds for the provision of care facilities and other care-related measures for children and family members will no longer be included in active labour market measures for women but, within the meaning of a joint responsibility of women and men, under a separate heading called ‘measures to help reconcile work and family life’.

Source: NAP 1999:42
Box A3: Implementation Report 1999, Gender Mainstreaming as a Horizontal Subject Area

III. HORIZONTAL SUBJECT AREAS

Gender Mainstreaming

Austria has already made the Gender-Mainstreaming approach the basis of its National Action Plan (NAP) for 1998. In the NAP for 99, gender-sensitising programmes are now being introduced in the framework of the G 19 and, at the same time, the effect on and the requirements of women and men are being taken into account even further in the individual guidelines. The incorporation of the various fields of interest begins with an analysis of the initial situation, continues with the objectives and budgetary implications and ends with the formulation of measures.

It was in this sense that Mainstreaming has also been incorporated in the first three guidelines. The analysis, that women are more often (long-term) unemployed has been taken into account in the objectives, the budgetary requirements and the programmes. The share of women participating in active job market programmes stood at 50.4% in 1998 and thereby above their share of the registered unemployed (45.6%). Even with regard to the funds utilised for active job market policies, the share of programmes for women that can be classified as gender-specific amounts to barely 50% (see also p.30). Also in the future, the utilisation of budgetary funds for the promotion of equal opportunity for girls and women should at least correspond to their share among the (long-term) unemployed.

Thereby, in order to make a clear-cut differentiation between what is clearly promotional activity for women and other programmes (e.g. family policy-related), in the future support for childcare will be indicated as “Measures for the Compatibility of Work and Family”.

In other guidelines, too, the different situation for women and men forms the basis of the design of the programmes: As women display on the whole a lower level of education, fewer professional degrees and poorer conditions during training and further education in companies, their opportunities for further education - especially also during maternity leave - are being improved. Likewise, the fact that women are confronted with greater difficulties while establishing and running a company, is being taken into account by designing counselling services accordingly.

In order to create adequate preconditions for the implementation of the Gender-Mainstreaming approach with all decision-makers in the future, gender-sensitising programmes are to be implemented. The employment of external gender experts and structures that would accompany and implement the process, as well as the evaluation of gender-specific effects of all measures is counted as part of these programmes.

When setting general objectives, it is assumed that they are to be attained for both genders (closing the gender-gap). Therefore, i.a., it is laid down in G 20, that the reduction in unemployment by the year 2002 to approximately 3.5% or the reduction of the share of 20-24 year olds who have not completed any professional education to 15% in the medium term (G 7) refer to both women and men.

Source: Implementation Report 1999:41
Box A4: Implementation Report 2000, GL 18 - Adopting a Gender-Mainstreaming Approach

**GL18 - Adopting a gender-Mainstreaming approach**

To achieve sustainable gender-mainstreaming and equal opportunities in all areas of the employment strategy, we need the willingness of policy-makers and social partners and a longer-term concept. The measures described in the NAP 1999 for appointing and training gender experts and implementing suitable structures designed to accompany and translate the process of gender mainstreaming are currently being built up but still require broader implementation. The creation of suitable instruments and methods for gender-related data collection systems and procedures is under way in some areas (such as AMS [PES] and school statistics), whereas other bodies (such as the federal computing centre, the social insurance carriers or the public work accident insurance institution) still require more fine-tuning.

Examples of how the gender-mainstreaming approach has already been implemented would be the following:

- The Austrian public employment service (AMS) [PES] launched a major gender mainstreaming initiative. It conducted research into the meaning, framework, necessary steps, methods and tools of gender mainstreaming. Part of the employment service's regulations, objectives, plans, guidelines, subsidy measures, reports, examination and evaluation specifications already involve equal opportunities considerations and gender mainstreaming (cf. GL 1-3 and 19-21).

- Within the ESF, essential strides have been made to implement gender mainstreaming. The Austrian ESF bodies have involved the Ministry for Women's Affairs from the very beginning. Special seminars for decision-makers provided information on the proper development of instruments, methods and indicators. An evaluation of how Austria implemented the equal opportunities objective of the European Social Fund was published and an international meeting on this issue was held. The results of all these efforts form the basis for the current programming period 2000-2006: gender mainstreaming is now a horizontal objective which is supplemented by a special women-specific priority area.

- In the former Federal Ministry of Labour, Health and Social Affairs an inter-departmental working group on gender mainstreaming was established. Among other positive action measures, the ministry conducted a mentoring project.

- The former Federal Ministry of Education and Cultural Affairs pursued gender mainstreaming and equal opportunities measures in teaching contents, but also in teacher training, in-service training, information and PR (cf. GL 7).

- The former Federal Ministry of Science and Research introduced measures to raise the proportion of women in official bodies, commissions and executive positions and measures to encourage research by, for and on women.

*Source: Implementation Report 2000:22*
Box A5: NAP 2000, New Measures for Implementing the Guidelines 2000 and New Policy Initiatives*

II.2. New measures for implementing the guidelines 2000 and new policy initiatives

GL1 - 3:
[1 - New start for young people]
[2 - Fresh start for long-term unemployed adults]
[3 - Increasing the number of people benefiting from active labour market measures]

- cf. section II.1.1.1. "recommendation on the participation of older workers in employment"
- cf. targets set for 2000 in Annex 1, Tables 11 and 12 and Annex 2, Table 20
- Development and implementation of a new programme ("Integra") focusing on community work and skills training for integrating the long-term unemployed into the labour market

GL4: [Reviewing the incentive effect of tax and benefit systems]

- cf. section II.1.1.1. "recommendation on the participation of older workers in employment"
- Enhancing the effectiveness of the incentive/disincentive system (Bonus-Malus-System) within the unemployment insurance scheme

GL6: [Lifelong learning]

- step up courses that enable drop-outs to complete compulsory education under the new ESF objective 3 (50 courses per year with approx. 850 participants) and develop materials for self-study
- step up the tele-learning courses on offer within regulated further education and the skills training measures for women within adult education programmes (especially technology training)
- New measures within the "lifelong learning" framework, especially for migrants, e.g. team teaching, specially developed German and literacy courses, etc.

GL7: [Improving the quality of school systems]

- Measures to reduce the drop-out rate at schools
- Foster the wider-access certificate (Berufsreifeprüfung) by developing special modules for prep courses

GL8: [Adaptability of young people]

- Give practice-oriented training at medium and higher level vocational schools a greater "entrepreneurship" focus
- Reduce deficits in English as a working language in, inter alia, various commercial and general education subjects
- Develop professional information and communication technology training options at higher level vocational schools and a new special school model offering IT skills training and work practice
- "Schools in the Internet" initiative: all schools will have Internet access by 2002

GL10: [Reducing overheads and administrative burdens for businesses]

- Strengthen the venture capital segment (complement the liability model by credit facilities for private borrowers of venture capital, more liberal investment regulations)
- Improve tax situation for participatory financing of SMEs
- Digitise public administration and social insurance institutions
- Design electronic commerce in line with market requirements

---

This is one of the highly controversial projects brought in by the new government.
GL11: [Reducing obstacles to self-employment]
- Unified plant law: to be implemented in several steps across the 2000-2002 period
- One-stop-shop (e-Government) to process applications for taxpayers' account numbers, small business start-ups and social insurance matters
- Comprehensive reform of Austria's trades regulation (*Gewerbeordnung*) including liberalised entrance to trades and more liberal ancillary rights
- Facilitate operation of private-sector placement and temporary work agencies

GL12: [Creating new jobs in the social, health and cultural sectors and at local level]
- Incorporate a specific priority area regarding territorial employment pacts and local employment initiatives in the new objective 3 programme for 2000-2006. Involve social partners, AMS and *laender* governments

GL13: [Fully exploiting the employment potential of the services sector]
- Further liberalisation of shop opening hours (extend framework opening hours from 66 to 72 hours) accompanied by more flexible working time arrangements for Saturday work in shops
- Liberalisation of access barriers to free-lance professions
- Allow "contracting models" to conserve energy and resources in housing construction by amending housing legislation 2000 (*Wohnrechtsnovelle 2000*) and extend environmental fund grants for energy contracting to territorial authorities

GL14: [Reducing taxes and fiscal pressures on labour and non-wage labour costs]
- Examine measures for a more ecology-minded tax system (e.g. tax on energy or on pollutant emissions, etc.), for a more sustainable use of resources, for reaching the target set at the Kyoto conference, and for finding other areas to finance the reductions in taxes and charges

GL18 - 21:
- [18 - Adopting a gender-mainstreaming approach]
- [19 - Tackling gender gaps in the labour market]
- [20 - Providing care services, parental leave schemes and family-friendly working hours]
- [21 - Easing return to working life]
- cf. section II.1.1.2. "recommendation on narrowing the gender gap"

*Source: Implementation Report 2000:33; *Titles of the GL were not mentioned in the original paper*

**Titles of GL not included here:**
- GL 5 Agreements between the social partners for training, work experience, traineeships or other measures likely to promote employability
- GL 9 Integration of the disabled, ethnic minorities and other disadvantaged groups
- GL 15 Social partners' agreement on modernising the organisation of work
- GL 16 Reform of employment contracts
- GL 17 Investment in human resources
Box A6: "ANLAGE 2", Example for a Gender Mainstreaming Action (Appendix of a Letter from the former FMLHS to the Social Partners)

Anlage 2:

VERANKERUNG DES GENDER-MAINSTREAMINGS IN DEN VERSCHIEDENEN NAP-BEREICHEN

Auch wenn den beschäftigungspolitischen Maßnahmen Österreichs insgesamt sowohl seitens der Europäischen Kommission als auch seitens unabhängiger WissenschaftlerInnen, die den NAP evaluierten, ein positives Zeugnis ausgestellt wird, wurden doch einige Schwachstellen aufgezeigt, die insbesondere die Arbeitsmarktsituation von Frauen betreffen.

So zielt von den Empfehlungen, die vom Europäischen Rat an die Mitgliedstaaten gerichtet wurden (insgesamt wurden drei an Österreich gerichtet), eine auf die großen geschlechtsspezifischen Arbeitsmarkt-Unterschieden ab: "Österreich sollte eine umfassende Strategie zur Verringerung der geschlechtsspezifischen Unterschiede in der Beschäftigungsbereich, u.a. durch Maßnahmen zur Vereinfachung der Vereinbarkeit von Beruf und Familie verfolgen."

Auch der "Gemeinsame Beschäftigungsbericht für 1999" und die NAP-Evaluation von WIFO und IHS zeigen, dass bei verschiedenen arbeitsmarktrelevanten Indikatoren noch immer große Unterschiede zwischen Frauen und Männern (so genannte Gender Gaps) bestehen, insbesondere große Einkommensunterschiede und eine hohe Segregation. Die Kommission bemängelt außerdem, dass der Gender-Mainstreaming-Ansatz noch nicht zur Gänze im NAP umgesetzt wurde, vor allem nicht in der Säule III.

Neben dem verstärkten Einsatz von frauspezifischen Maßnahmen, die den ungleichen Bedingungen und Chancen am Arbeitsmarkt entgegenwirken, gilt es daher die Umsetzung des Gender Mainstreaming zu forcieren, wie dies ja bereits mit der LL 19 der Beschäftigungspolitischen Leitlinien 1999 festgelegt wurde.

Was heißt Gender-Mainstreaming?

Gender-Mainstreaming bedeutet die systematische Berücksichtigung der unterschiedlichen Ausgangsbedingungen von Frauen und Männern in allen Politikbereichen und Prozessen bei der Planung, Umsetzung und Bewertung von Massnahmen.


Konkrete Vorschläge zur besseren Verankerung des Gender-Mainstreaming in den NAP-Bereichen bzw. den Institutionen, die NAP-relevante Maßnahmen umsetzen:

- Schulungen, Workshops, Trainings, Konferenzen zur Sensibilisierung und Entwicklung von Know-how über Gender-Mainstreaming-Strategien
- Ernennung von Gender-ExpertInnen und Implementierung von geeigneten internen prozessbegleitenden und -umsetzenden Strukturen
- Massnahmen zur geschlechtsspezifischen Datensammlung und -aufarbeitung sowie im Berichtswesen
- Weiterentwicklung der "Train the Trainer-Seminare" in den Weiterbildungsinstitutionen zur Bewusstseinsbildung und Know-how-Schulung im Bereich Chancengleichheit
- Managing Equality-Seminare zur Bewusstseinsbildung für Führungskräfte/PersonalistInnen
- Positive Aktionen, Mentoring-Projekte, Quoten etc. zur chancengleichen Besetzung von Gremien und beruflichen Positionen
- Anreize zur Erstellung und Umsetzung von Frauenförderplänen, Frauenbeauftragten u.a. im Rahmen von Betriebsvereinbarungen u.a.
- Teilnahme an Total E-Quality-Verfahren

Im Sinne der Vorgaben der Beschäftigungspolitischen Leitlinie 19 ist es daher wichtig, dass die Berichterstattung über die geplanten und umgesetzten Initiativen explizit darauf bezug nimmt, inwiefern Massnahmen im Sinne des Gender-Mainstreaming gesetzt wurden und welche weiteren Schritte geplant sind. Sämtliche quantitative und qualitative Angaben sollten zudem geschlechtsspezifisch differenziert ausgewiesen werden, damit eine Bewertung der Fortschritte im Bereich Chancengleichheit vorgenommen werden kann.

Source: Former Federal Ministry of Labour, Health and Social Affairs, March 2000